

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

MTR TAN1302911 NRM-LED

1. Introduction

The midterm review of the NRM4LED project in Kigoma was organised from June 7th to 21st, 2017. All major stakeholders were contacted and debriefing meetings organised in Kigoma and Brussels.

The NRM4LED 60-month project with budget of € 6 million will end in August 2019. Its **overall objective/expected impact** is to ensure that ecosystem resilience is maintained to sustainably provide socio-economic and environmental benefits to local communities in Kigoma Region in Tanzania. Its **specific objective** is “An improved enabling environment and strengthened capacities for sustainable management of NR linked to an equitable Local Economic Development resulting in increased benefits for the communities of selected landscapes in Kigoma Region”. The target group of the project are communities in 36 villages and local government authorities in 6 ‘landscapes’ in Kigoma Region.

The basic premise of the NRM4LED is that the population of the villages that are involved in the community based management of natural resources (CBNRM) will be more motivated to conserve and manage these resources when given the immediate and long term benefits of these natural resources. The ‘Landscape approach’ is the guiding principle in the project strategy¹.

The Project Implementation Unit comprises a National Project Manager, an international Co-Manager (vacant since 12/2016), an international contract and Finance Officer (50% FTE), 3 National Technical Advisors and 3 District Technical Advisors. The latter collaborate strongly with District Project Team (DPT) and district focal point (DFP).

2. Project Outputs and Activities

Output 1: Decision Support System (DSS) on NRM for LGAs established, enabling mainstreaming in decentralized planning of key NRM issues

- DSS exercise being amended
- Situation analysis exercises in all districts - to identify NR endowments.
- Selection of 6 landscapes
- Obstacles and Opportunities to Development (O&OD) to members of village councils, natural resource committees, land tribunals, and local CBOs
- Participatory Baseline Survey (BLS)
- Participatory M & E Plan

¹ Such ‘landscape approach’ addresses growing pressure on land, water and other NR through the integration of use of NR and agricultural production with environmental management, through process oriented activities and multi stakeholder involvement.

Output 2: Improved Governance and sustainable management of NR by local institutions and key resource user

- Review and/or establishment of 27 Village Land Use Management teams (VLUM) and the training to 60 committees on Community Based Natural Resources Management
- 25 VLUP (14 approved by Village Assemblies) and 25 sets of bylaws
- Sensitization meetings and household surveys before issuing 550 Certificates of Customary Right of Occupancy in 2 villages per landscape
- The 6 Step CBNRM Process: 33 Village Natural Resources Committees (VNRC), 3 Beach management Units (BMUs), and 5 Fishing Groups established.
- No follow-up of the beekeeping reserves and groups (ex BSPK) Participatory Fisheries Resources Management facilitated through training of 45 BMU leaders and 75 fishing group leaders
- 3 Fisheries Management Plans approved in the Lake Tanganyika Landscape
- 39 Forest Management Plans (39) and bylaws prepared
- 4 sustainable harvesting plans developed
- Sale of poles from VLFRs to refugee agencies (50 to 80 million TZS in 3 villages).

Gender and NRM

- A gender strategy elaborated.
- TOT training for some District staff
- Capacity building for gender and governance in 24 villages.
- Gender mainstreaming training to 45 BMU leaders
- 26 gender role models identified in 12 villages.
- Community Dialogues organised in 6 villages
- Study "Capacity and Training Needs Assessment on Gender and Governance" ongoing.

Output 3: Key resource users, transformers and traders of NR derive sustainable and equitable benefits from natural resources

- Business Development training for some district staff
- Identification and basic training of 94 Income Generating Activities (IGA) groups.
- Study on Economic Valuation of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Services.

Output 4: Strengthened institutional capacities and accountability of key stakeholders for improved gender sensitive NR governance, landscape coordination and implementation of CBNRM

- Producing media packages not achieved
- Conflict resolution training in villages, wards and districts
- Study to assess conflict management on-going.

3. Implementation

Some PIU members left shortly after their recruitment, mainly due to the relative isolation of Kigoma Region. The Project Manager is the Regional Natural Resources Officer. A new co-manager will join the team.

The overall quality of the studies is acceptable, but the findings, conclusions and recommendations have not systematically been shared nor translated into new/appropriate approaches and strategic decisions and priorities. Field reports (e.g. of trainings and visits) do not contain sufficient information about the

situation and issues that were raised or discussed with the project stakeholders. The annual reports don't contain sufficient information to assess the attribution of results to the project.

The **Joint Local Partner Committee**, chaired by the Director of the Forestry and Beekeeping Division (FBD) of the MNRT, has been mostly involved in strategic problem solving but less in strategic reflections on the implementation of the project.

The involvement of the Regional Facilitation Team is rather weak. The Districts are largely involved in and committed to the project implementation. The 3 DTA collaborate strongly with the District Focal Point who is the lead of the **District Facilitation Team**. Both **the district and the landscape stakeholder meetings** informed about project progress and discussed the next work plan. Due to limited available budgets at the district level, the field activities of the district staff depended largely on project financing. The **Ward level** is less involved in project activities apart from the Ward Land Tribunals.

Financial Management At end May 2017 (at 39/60 months) € 2,186,453 or about TZS 5,356 billion has been spent (36% of the total budget). Expenses related to the project implementation (A + B) amount to € 1,415,142 € or 3.4767billion TZS.

Monitoring and Evaluation System the NRM4LED has a rather complicated/complex **Theory of Change** with 4 sub-ToC for each different output, with little linkages and mutual assumptions between them. The developed 'pathways' for the different results have never been elaborated further to an 'integrated' TOC of the project. The M & E officer has elaborated an extensive '**Internal Data Quality Assessment Guide**' based on the logical framework but insufficient attention is given to data collection by the PIU and at district level. Some indicators are missing (see R3 and gender) while others do not fully translate the project processes and achievements. The project has not been able to provide a good quantitative overview of the project interventions and progress reached up to now.

4. Analysis According to OECD –DAC Criteria

Excellent Relevance the NRM4LED is fully relevant in view of Tanzanian policies on forestry and environment, the natural environment in Kigoma Region and opportunities for income generating activities. It is in line with the Belgian Policies. The combination of NRM with LED is a clear answer to the opportunity offered to local villages to better manage their forests and village land and water resources through better planning and internal organisation, with positive impact on livelihoods.

Weak Efficiency because of the large delay in the project start-up and the delays in the implementation of R3/LED. The village level processes took longer than expected due to a weak implementation process, conflicts, counsellor bureaucracy (in addition to less pre-existing VLUP). Training of trainers reached relevant district and regional staff but some training (e.g. gender and NR) were too short to really capacitate the DFT and no training materials or follow-up were provided. Training at village level proved to be too short for villagers to fully understand the processes and challenges involved and no follow-up was provided due to limited availability of the district staff.

Mixed Effectiveness

Result/Output 1 was only partially effective. The Situation Analysis completed and landscapes selected, Baseline Survey completed. O&OD training was provided to identify NR issues in village plans. However, the DSS was never developed and a DSS working group and consultant are still not in place. Participatory M&E is not effective. The M&E system appears to be not functioning.

Result/Output 2 was effective: Governance structures have been established for lands (VLUM); forestry (VNRC); fisheries (BMU or Fish Groups) and trained on good governance, CBNRM steps, and conflict resolution. Management plans have been prepared and approved at village level. However, conflicts still abound, especially those prompted by forces outside the landscapes.

Result/Output 3 was not very effective since very little efforts were made to support IGA and VICOPA's prior to Q2 2017. The BDS training for DFT had an effect on the capacity of the district staff to support micro-enterprises at village level.

Result/Output 4 has low effectiveness so far. Participating in events and involving school environment clubs is less effective. There are no adequate CEPA strategies and no materials and channels developed for extension and public awareness, so information is not being packaged and disseminated yet.

5. Conclusions

The NRM4LED project has achieved important results in the creation and strengthening of different natural resources related structures at village level in the process of elaborating VLUP, VFRMP - in view of sustainably managing the available human resources – in 6 landscapes of Kigoma Region in collaboration with 6 District Facilitation Teams. The capacity of the village leaders (including a high % of women) has been strengthened, but some refresher training and coaching is needed to sustain the effects of the many trainings.

Some timid changes are noticeable in the district strategy and interventions with regard to natural resources but the overall national context with regard to decentralisation hampers these processes. The capacities of the district staff have been strengthened but the limited resources (human and financial) at district level combined with the frequent changes of politicians and staff limits the intervention capacity of the district beyond the project. CCROs have been issued on a limited scale. The NRM4LED has started strengthening the IGAs but NRM was so far not sufficiently linked to LED. Benefits for the local communities are clearly visible in some villages (e.g. improved social services based on the sale of poles) but remain to be materialised in other villages.

The capacity building of both districts and villages is clearly within the *sphere of control* of the project as well as the start-up of community processes. However, the way these processes/dynamics evolve is in their *sphere of influence* since local politics and leadership strongly affect progress towards CBNRM. The training and coaching on conflict management is vital to limiting blockages on the road to CBNRM.

The most notable accomplishments of the project are fisheries and forest management planning.

Working in specific landscapes creates conditions for developing common processes and synergies between all stakeholders involved. The critical/crucial elements of the landscape approach (e.g. participatory, multi-actor approach) were taken into account but the MTR expected to find more synergies within the landscapes (ripple effect).

Improved Governance and Management of Natural Resources The project has reached formal administrative results (VLUP/CCRO/VLFR) but the focus has been less on stimulating a reflection process and implementation. The new governance structures have carried out resource stock assessments and management planning in forestry and fisheries. The plans and bylaws are delayed at ward or district level **IGA/VICOBA support or Local economic development** Efforts to support income generating activities and local financial institutions were very weak during the first half of the project with little expertise of the PIU/DTA. The limited capital and management capacity of the Village Community Banks (VICOBAs) will not yet enable them to play a significant role in the financing of NR based IGA. Reflection on LED was not explicitly integrated in the Land Use Planning and Forest Management. The increase of village income from the sales of poles and timber could have supported the IGAs and VICOBAs.

Excellent gender dynamics There is a strong participation of women in the different processes and committees (e.g. around 35% in VLUM). Women were better informed but their voices were not always heard or translated in the decision-making process. There is still need to strengthen the gender awareness (both men and women) at all levels.

Good focus on Conflict Management The capacity of selected villages to manage conflicts was strengthened. The district staff and DED have intervened in many instances to settle disputes between villages. Some dormant conflicts are coming back to the surface when the access to land is formalised.

6. Recommendations

The MTR proposes to continue working in the 6 landscapes and concentrate on the village and landscape level activities. A DSS Team Leader and CEPA NTA (to be recruited) must facilitate the collection of existing information and package this into useable materials at all levels.

Village level implementation The NRM4LED should accompany a reflection process on the different NR plans and their implementation with decentralised decision-making and representation within the village. Communication and spreading of information should be promoted with adequate tools and methods. Transparency by village and committee leaders should be enhanced. Part of the revenues from NRM could stimulate local IGA and employment, in particular of youth.

Strengthening local capacity: Based on the limited capacity and availability of the district facilitation staff, the MTR proposes to train villagers to become trainers/coaches for others – for the management of the VFR/BMU as of IGAs.

Continuation of supporting the issuing of CCROs in an inclusive process might further contribute to improved governance and management of NR and strengthening of the local capacity.

Building bridges between district, landscapes, ward and villages the project should identify synergies and common agenda's within each of the landscapes. The districts should shift from their present role of implementation of trainings to monitoring local processes and verifying the results of local capacity building efforts.

NRM Policies to stimulate and police some aspects of NRM policies could be reviewed in order to gain optimal efficiency and effectiveness of the CBNRM processes:

- Empower Communities to negotiate prices of NR products such as timber, poles, charcoal, fuel wood, etc.
- In addition to extension to villages, districts are expected to undertake administrative functions but they cannot possibly fulfil their mandate with the small levies that they are allowed to charge. PORALG, MoF and MNRT should develop a mechanism for more equitably sharing the revenue from forest trade with the districts and allow districts more discretion over the use of government block grants.
- By better enforcement of NR laws and regulations, illegal forest products should become more expensive and therefore legal products should be more competitive.
- Apply policies consistently: Vested interests have to be identified and mitigated otherwise communities become demoralized.

A national NR Strategic Development Programme: The MNRT must take the lead in promoting NRM for LED and develop a "NRM first" programme that can educate leaders and communities on the benefits of a healthy environment and the potential of CBNRM to poverty reduction.

NR Value chains chained locally In order to avoid spreading limited resources too thinly and reach optimal results within the next 2 years, the MTR proposes that the projects focuses on value chains which offer the opportunities for large scale income generation and employment creation such as beekeeping, wood products (timber, charcoal) and fisheries (lake/river fisheries and aquaculture) i.e. where technologies can be mainstreamed and markets opportunities captured by a larger group, in particular women and youth. Dynamic local men and women should be trained as resource person for IGA groups and individuals. The management capacity of the VICOBA/SACCOs could be strengthened.

Gender mainstreamed Continue to sensitize DFT and other service providers on gender in NRM & LED through integrating the topic in all trainings and address also the male population in the villages. The 'role models' should receive attractive IEC materials.

M & E The theory of change should be reviewed and simplified with more explicit links between the 4 result areas/outputs common assumptions. Indicators should be reviewed and new indicators on R3I interventions included. All staff and DFT partners should participate in the data collection for the M & E system.

Project Implementation/Facilitation The coordination and collaboration between the NTAs and the DTA should be strengthened. The PIU and DFT should make better use of the studies. Reports should be more useful and accessible to districts and villages. Long/costly assessments with many village consultations should be abandoned in favour of 'action-research' approaches. 'Learning by doing' methods should be applied.

