



Enabel 



# Final report

Enhancing Capacities for Institution Building

PZA 12 029 11

# Table of contents

<b>Acronyms .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Intervention form.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Global appreciation .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>PART 1: Results achieved and lessons learned.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1     Assessing the intervention strategy .....</b>	<b>8</b>
1.1     Context .....	8
1.2     Important changes in intervention strategy.....	10
<b>2     Results achieved .....</b>	<b>13</b>
2.1     Monitoring matrix .....	13
2.2     Analysis of results .....	17
2.2.1     To what extent will the intervention contribute to the impact (potential impact)?	17
2.2.2     To what extent has the outcome been achieved? Explain.	19
2.2.3     To what extent have outputs been achieved? Explain	20
2.2.4     To what extent did outputs contribute to the achievement of the outcome	21
2.2.5     Assess the most important influencing factors. What were major issues encountered? How were they addressed by the intervention?	22
2.2.6     Assess the unexpected results, both negative and positive ones	22
2.2.7     Assess the Integration of Transversal Themes in the intervention strategy	23
2.2.8     To what extent have M&E, backstopping activities To what extent have M&E, backstopping activities and/or audits contributed to the attainment of results? How were recommendations dealt with?	25
<b>3     Sustainability .....</b>	<b>26</b>
3.1.1     What is the economic and financial viability What is the economic and financial viability of the results of the intervention? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?	26
3.1.2     What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?	28
3.1.3     What was the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?	29
3.1.4     How well has the intervention contributed to institutional and management capacity? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?	29
<b>4     Learning.....</b>	<b>30</b>
4.1     Lessons Learned .....	30
4.2     Recommendations.....	33
<b>PART 2: Synthesis of (operational) monitoring .....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>1     Follow-up of decisions by the JLCB .....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>2     Expenses.....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>3     Disbursement rate of the intervention .....</b>	<b>39</b>

4	Personnel of the intervention .....	39
5	Public procurement .....	41
6	Public agreements .....	41
7	Equipment .....	41
8	Original Logical Framework from TFF .....	42
9	Complete Monitoring Matrix.....	44
10	Tools and products .....	52

## Acronyms

<b>A(S)CO</b>	Arab (Standard) Classification of Occupations
<b>AQAC</b>	Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission
<b>BI</b>	Beneficiary Institutions
<b>BTC</b>	Belgian Technical Cooperation (Belgian Development Agency before 2018)
<b>CCI</b>	Chamber of Commerce and Industry
<b>CGC</b>	Career Guidance and Counselling
<b>CVET</b>	Continuous Vocational Education and Training
<b>ECIB</b>	Enhancing Capacities for Institution Building
<b>EDSP</b>	Education Development Strategic Plan
<b>Enabel</b>	Belgian Development Agency (Since 2018)
<b>ETF</b>	European Training Foundation
<b>ETR</b>	End-Term Review
<b>ESWG</b>	Education Sector Working Group of the MoEHE
<b>FPCCIA</b>	Federation of Palestinian Chambers of Commerce, Industry & Agriculture
<b>HRD</b>	Human Resources Development
<b>GIZ</b>	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
<b>IRPAL</b>	Islamic Relief Palestine
<b>ISE</b>	International Sector Expert
<b>ISS</b>	Industrial Secondary School
<b>ITC-ILO</b>	International Training Center of the International Labour Organisation
<b>JFA</b>	Joint Financing Arrangement
<b>JMS</b>	TVET-Labour Market Joint Management Structure
<b>KfW</b>	Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau
<b>LETC</b>	Local Employment and TVET Councils
<b>LLL</b>	Life Long Learning
<b>LM</b>	Labour Market
<b>LMIS</b>	Labour Market Information System
<b>LMS</b>	Labour Market Survey
<b>M&amp;E</b>	Monitoring and Evaluation
<b>N/A</b>	Not Applicable
<b>MoEHE</b>	Ministry of Education & Higher Education
<b>MoFP</b>	Ministry of Finance and Planning
<b>MoL</b>	Ministry of Labour
<b>MoSD</b>	Ministry of Social Development
<b>MoU</b>	Memorandum of Understanding
<b>MoWA</b>	Ministry of Women's Affair
<b>MPC</b>	Ministry Program Coordinator

<b>MTR</b>	Mid-Term Review
<b>NDP</b>	National Development Plan
<b>NTA</b>	National Technical Advisor
<b>NIET</b>	National Institute for Educational Training
<b>NQF</b>	National Qualification Framework
<b>oPT</b>	Occupied Palestinian Territories
<b>OSS</b>	One Stop Shop
<b>PCBS</b>	Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics
<b>PCDC</b>	Palestinian Curriculum Development Centre
<b>PFI</b>	Palestinian Federation of Industries
<b>PFESP</b>	Palestinian Fund for Employment and Social Protection (Employment Fund)
<b>PMT</b>	Program Management Team
<b>POC</b>	Palestinian Occupational Classification
<b>PPP</b>	Public Private Partnerships
<b>PRDP</b>	Palestinian Reform and Development Plan
<b>PS</b>	Private Sector
<b>QA</b>	Quality Assurance
<b>QCC</b>	Quality Control Committee
<b>SC</b>	Steering Committee
<b>SD</b>	Skills Development
<b>SP</b>	Social Partners
<b>SVS</b>	Secondary Vocational School
<b>TC</b>	Technical College
<b>TE</b>	Technical Education
<b>TFF</b>	Technical and Financial File
<b>ToC</b>	Theory of Change
<b>ToT</b>	Training of Trainers
<b>TOR</b>	Terms of Reference
<b>TVET</b>	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
<b>UNESCO</b>	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
<b>UNRWA</b>	United Nations Relief and Works Agency
<b>VE</b>	Vocational Education
<b>VT</b>	Vocational Training
<b>VTC</b>	Vocational Training Centre
<b>WBL</b>	Work-based Learning

## Intervention form

<b>Intervention name</b>	Enhancing Capacities for Institution Building (ECIB)
<b>Intervention Code</b>	PZA 12 029 11
<b>Location</b>	Palestine (Palestinian Territory)
<b>Budget</b>	5 million Euros
<b>Partner Institution</b>	Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE), Ministry of Labour (MoL)
<b>Date intervention start /Opening steering committee</b>	17 July 2013
<b>End date Specific Agreement</b>	16 July 2018
<b>Target groups</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Staff members of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Ministry of Labour, UNRWA and Private Sector Organisations (Federations, Chambers, etc.)</li> <li>- Staff members of TVET institutes</li> <li>- Staff of companies</li> <li>- Economically and socially disadvantaged trainees in Palestinian Higher Education Institutions (Technical Colleges) at the Under-Graduate level, in Secondary Vocational Schools, Vocational Training Centers and in apprenticeship programs</li> <li>- Palestinian youth in TVET and their families</li> </ul>
<b>Impact<sup>1</sup></b>	Contribution is brought to state building through enhancing the Palestinian capacities in view of institutional development
<b>Outcome</b>	The institutional capacities of the beneficiary institutions involved in the apprenticeships scheme and scholarships are improved
<b>Outputs</b>	<p><u>Output 1:</u> At the national level relevant policy makers, private sector organisations and other Social Partners are capacitated and working together to facilitate and supervise the implementation of different work-based learning schemes</p> <p><u>Output 2:</u> At the local level relevant stakeholders are capacitated and are implementing Work-based Learning</p> <p><u>Output 3:</u> Economically and socially disadvantaged youth have improved access to training and coaching</p>
<b>Total budget of the intervention</b>	EUR 5 000 000 (Belgian Contribution) EUR 148 000 (Partner Contribution) EUR 5 148 000 (Total Contribution)
<b>Period covered by the report</b>	2017-2018

<sup>1</sup> Impact is a synonym for global objective, Outcome is a synonym for specific objective, output is a synonym for result

## Global appreciation

<b>Describe</b> your global appreciation of the intervention (max 200 words):	<b>Describe</b> your global appreciation of the intervention (max 200 words):
<p>The intervention contributed to the improvement of the quality and sustainability TVET in Palestine through introducing the WBL scheme to TVET providers and the private sector. This enhanced the private public partnership between public TVET institutions and the private sector and convinced both parties that improved quality of TVET means better quality of private sector output. This partnership contributed to a real change within the mindset of both parties towards better strategic cooperation and coordination.</p> <p>The intervention facilitated the access of poor and marginalized youth and women to TVET through providing scholarships, which especially made a difference in Gaza Strip where 60% of young people are unemployed. Participating TVET institutions and private sector companies were capacitated to implement WBL and the scheme was adopted by the TVET institutions and private sector and later systematized through a national WBL strategy, which was approved and endorsed by the TVET Higher Council.</p> <p>The intervention created an increased employment rate of TVET graduates: more than 60 % of the WBL graduates got sustainable employment opportunities within the PS or became self-employed. It also became one of the key indicators of other TVET actors like GIZ and IRPAL to integrate WBL within their upcoming programs.</p> <p>The intervention succeeded to enhance the coordination between the main three TVET actors by establishing a coordination group between GIZ, IRPAL and Enabel, which resulted in conducting different joint activities to promote TVET, such as the TVET week, summer camps, etc.</p>	<p>The intervention has reached nearly all its objectives and has contributed in a substantial way to the enhancement of the quality and labour-market relevance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Palestine through the introduction of the Work-based Learning (WBL) scheme.</p> <p>By creating tangible public private partnerships between TVET institutes and private companies on the local and regional level and the creation of a TVET-LM Joint Management Structure (JMS) consisting of international agencies, Ministries (MoL, MoEHE), private sector umbrella organisations, and labour unions, the intervention has significantly contributed to the strengthening of the coordination and cooperation between the different TVET-LM stakeholders.</p> <p>By introducing a pro-poor and pro-gender scholarship scheme, the intervention has increased the accessibility of TVET for marginalised groups, in particular women.</p> <p>The sustainability of the intervention is guaranteed by the development of a national WBL Strategy and legal provisions that will integrate of the WBL scheme in the TVET system in Palestine. On a structural level, the reactivation of the Higher Council for TVET and the creation of a Development Center as its executive arm, will guarantee a better coordination between the TVET stakeholders and reduce the fragmentation of TVET in Palestine.</p>
<b>Score</b> your global appreciation of the intervention <sup>2</sup> :	<b>Score</b> your global appreciation of the intervention <sup>3</sup> :
Very satisfactory	Very satisfactory
National execution official	Enabel execution official
Haneen Abu Nahla	Bart Horemans

<sup>2</sup> Very satisfactory - Satisfactory - Non-satisfactory, in spite of some positive elements - Non-satisfactory

<sup>3</sup> Very satisfactory - Satisfactory - Non-satisfactory, in spite of some positive elements - Non-satisfactory



## PART 1: Results achieved and lessons learned

### 1 Assessing the intervention strategy

#### 1.1 Context

##### General Context

The Israeli occupation continues to define the Palestinian context, with political and economic restrictions preventing socio-economic development in the region, especially in the Gaza Strip. Because of this, the ability of the private sector to thrive is limited and the Palestinian economy remains highly dependent on the public sector, which counts for 15% of employment in the West Bank and 36% in Gaza<sup>4,5</sup> The deterioration of the overall economic situation in Palestine, combined with a rapid population growth and an ever-higher number of people entering the labour market has significantly increased unemployment, especially among Palestinian youth. In 2017, unemployment in Palestine reached 27,4% among labour force participants, 0,5% higher than in 2016, and was the highest in Gaza with 43,6% unemployment, compared to 18% in the West Bank. Labour participation and unemployment also has a strong gender dimension, with male participation rates around 71% and female participation rates as low as 19%. Regarding youth aged between 15-29 years old, a mere 41% participate in the labour market of which a staggering 40% is unemployed.<sup>6</sup> Additionally, it has been assessed that about 50% of Palestinian economy is informal and a significant part of the Palestinian working force is employed in Israel.

Currently, Palestine knows a modest GDP growth of 2,4%, while at least a growth of 12% would be needed to significantly decrease the high unemployment level.<sup>7</sup> The Palestinian government should therefore ensure productive employment for its expanding labour force and develop policies that address investment in human capital and job creation, especially for youth and women. At the moment, there is still a significant mismatch between the labour market needs and the qualifications of Palestinian graduates, who are often encouraged to pursue academic degrees, mostly in humanities, for which there is a very low labour market demand. This is particularly the case for female graduates.

In contrast, there is a high demand for technical skills in the private sector, but less than 3% of the Palestinian student population obtains a degree in technical and vocational education and training (TVET). It is important to mention that commercial schools are no longer classified as part of the TVET sector and have been attracting increasing numbers of students over the past 10 years. There is recently a small increase in the enrolment of students in TVET, most probably linked to increased community awareness of the importance of Vocational Education and Training, the introduction of new specialisations with high demand in the labour market and new and better adapted training methodologies such as competence-based training, work-based-learning. Female enrolment in TVET is dramatically low, only increasing with a meagre 0.6%. Cultural traditions are the main reason for this and this is also reflected in the extreme small women active in the labor market with recent participation rates of not more than 19 percent.<sup>8</sup>

Suggested actions for improvement as proposed by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE) include: Establishing new vocational schools, integrating new streams that meet labor market

<sup>4</sup> World Bank, *Economic Monitoring Report to the Ad Hoc Liaison Committee*, March 2018, p.23.

<sup>5</sup> Press Release on the Results of the Labour Force Survey in Palestine, 2016. Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS), 16 February 2017.

<sup>6</sup> World Bank, *idem*, p. 10.

<sup>7</sup> World Bank, *idem*, p. 9.

<sup>8</sup> World Bank, *Idem*, p. 10.



needs and creating new specialisations for female students.<sup>9</sup> *Mutatis mutandis* the same suggestions are valid for the Ministry of Labour (MoL). For reasons of international comparability of data and information, it would be advisable to re-integrate the commercial stream in TVET.<sup>10</sup>

## **Institutional Context**

Since the establishment of a new government in 2015, several institutional changes and developments took place in the two most relevant Ministries for the intervention: The Ministry of Labour (MoL) and the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE).

Shortly after Dr. Sabri Saidam was appointed Minister of Education and Higher Education, he presented a 15-point plan with 21 reform milestones, which was met with some controversy by the donor community, in particular, the introduction of TVET courses in grades 7, 8 and 9 in primary education. Regarding TVET, the Minister initiated a change in key positions within the MoEHE and merged the governmental technical colleges with Kadouri Technical University. Near the end of 2015, the MoEHE created a Thematic Working Group (TWG) for TVET under the umbrella of the Reformed Education Sector Working Group (ESWG). This TWG is co-chaired by the MoEHE, MoL and the German Agency for International Cooperation (GIZ) and is currently fully operational.

On the side of the Ministry of Labour, Mr. Maemoun Abu Shahla took his position as new Minister of Labour in 2015. In September 2015, the Minister presented an integrated Strategic Program for Employment, foreseeing a central role for TVET, Work-Based Learning (WBL) and entrepreneurship training to combat the high youth unemployment. In the beginning of 2018 the MoL started a reform process that would allow the Ministry to be more effective in stimulating employment in Palestine. Although institutional reform of the MoL was more than necessary, it remains to be seen if this will solve or mitigate the structural challenges of the ministry: lack of adequate funding, staffing and logistics.

Between 2015 and 2018, several meetings took place to revitalise the Higher Council for TVET and the Executive Board and the Development Centre, as the main national governance structure for TVET. The Higher Council brings together the main TVET stakeholders in Palestine: MoEHE, MoL, PFCCIA, PFI, NGO-VET league, Trade Unions, ILO and academic experts, but does not include the international partners. Once the Development Center created in September 2017 is fully operational, this structure will become the driving force and national regulator of all TVET-LM related policies and reforms in Palestine. While significant progress has been made and the structures are now in place, it remains premature to assess its future performance and impact.<sup>11</sup>

## **Execution Modalities Context**

The ECIB program is executed under Enabel management. This has obvious advantages as it simplifies disbursement procedures and there is less chance that the program will accumulate delays due to internal procedures of the different partner Ministries. This is particularly relevant in the case of ECIB which has a diverse group of partners and stakeholders from the public and private sector and the civil society.

At the same time the ownership of the main partners: the MoEHE, the MoL and the private sector is assured through the Steering Committee and the Joint TVET-Labour Market Management Structure (see below). The ECIB Steering Committee remains responsible for providing the strategic guidance for the program and approves the action plans and any modification or adaptation of the intervention, including the budget.

---

<sup>9</sup> MoEHE. *Result-Based Monitoring and Evaluation System For the third Education Development Strategic Plan (EDSP III 2014-2019). Annual Report 2016, General Directorate of Educational Planning Monitoring and Evaluation Department, 2017, p. 106. (MoEHE, M&E Report 2016)*

<sup>10</sup> Informal discussion with the European Training Foundation on this topic in preparation of country fiche for Palestine.

<sup>11</sup> See Chapters 2 and 3 below for more details on the new united TVET governance structure in Palestine.

A number of work packages have been developed during the inception phase of the intervention allowing a fluid implementation. The document was formally adopted by the Steering Committee in June 2015 and is an integral part of the TFF.

The ECIB program has developed its own internal monitoring and evaluation system. The initial idea was to align this to the national M&E framework foreseen to be operational at the start of the intervention. Unfortunately, this was not the case and since then progress is slow with nonetheless some important progress, including the development of national monitoring and evaluation system and a number of key indicators in 2017 which will become part of the standard monitoring policy at all TVET levels in Palestine. Once the Development Center will fully be operational, an M&E unit will take the lead in developing this national M&E framework.

### **Harmo-Dynamics Context**

Notwithstanding the substantial progress that has been made in recent years in terms of cooperation and coordination, the TVET-LM subsector in Palestine remains fragmented with a great variety of (inter)national private and public stakeholders.

To overcome this fragmentation, GIZ and BTC-Enabel decided to create a joint coordinating structure for TVET consisting of representatives of the MoL, the MoEHE, the private sector, NGO's and Social Partners. This TVET-LM Joint Management Structure (JMS) was fully operational mid-2015. The JMS operates as a Technical Advisory Committee for the TVET programs in Palestine. This JMS has the obvious advantage of improving coordination and cooperation between the two programs which have similar objectives. It will avoid duplication, contradictory implementation and overburdening of the (same) partners. It includes joint planning, joint execution and joint evaluation, but it does not include joint funding as each partner keeps his full financial autonomy. Both agencies remain accountable to their own Steering Committees and national Ministries.

The JMS triggered the reactivation of the Higher Council for TVET and the creation of the Development Center at the end of 2017.

In addition to the JMS, GIZ and Enabel worked closely together and jointly organised a large number of activities ranging from joint promotion and awareness raising campaigns (WorldSkills, TVET weeks and TVET summer camps), over joint lobby activities to co-funding of WBL initiatives (Scholarships for GIZ TVET initiatives in East-Jerusalem).

In the Gaza Strip a similar coordination structure was created with GIZ, IRPAL and the Local TVET and Employment (LET) Council.

As mentioned above, on the strategic level, a high level Technical Working Group for TVET & Employment was created early 2016 under the Education Sector Working Group (ESWG) structure of the MoEHE. It replaces the informal multi-donor/agencies coordination meeting that until then brought the most important international partners together on a regular basis to exchange information and define joint strategic actions in the TVET-LM subsector.

The scope and membership of this Technical Working Group continuously increased and can now be considered as the principal coordination and exchange forum for all national and international stakeholders in TVET in Palestine.

## **1.2 Important changes in intervention strategy**

The initial objective of the ECIB program originates from the desire of the Directorate-general of Development (DGD) of the Federal Government of Belgium, to develop a new approach to capacity building, replacing the old approach which favoured high-level individual multi-year university studies.

The new approach will enhance the integration of many good practice experiences of individual project-type interventions into mainstream policies and implementation.<sup>12</sup>

For the Palestinian Capacity Building Programme, part of the Indicative Cooperation Programme 2012-2015, DGD opted for an approach with 2 components:

- The capacity building regarding Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), with a focus on apprenticeship
- The capacity building regarding open scholarships to better reach families with disadvantaged backgrounds

In the start-up period (2013-4), the new intervention focused nearly exclusively on positioning itself while building upon previous developments in apprenticeships in Palestine to create a solid base for the further roll out of the intervention and searching a common ground amongst the main actors involved in the apprenticeship schemes in TVET.

During 2014 the intervention focused on setting a framework for the coming years. An important aspect was the intensified donor coordination with all relevant stakeholders in TVET and building a solid framework for a modern apprenticeship scheme in Palestine. To ensure the integration of regional experiences and examples of apprenticeship programs, the program worked closely together with the main international technical actors in the field of TVET: ILO, ETF and GIZ.

To have a complete picture the intervention launched an extended inception study (including a baseline study) and organised a participatory Theory of Change workshop with the main TVET regional stakeholders. Both elements provided a better understanding of the regional context and the specific challenges of rolling out a program in an occupied country. Based on this newly acquired insights and the recommendations of the inception report, the initial Logframe of the intervention and its indicators were updated, and the monitoring matrix was completed.

The most important change concerned a refocusing of the program on a more contemporary approach towards TVET and the integration of practical learning experience in the curriculum. For this reason, the initial “apprenticeship” concept was broadened to the now generally applied Work-based Learning (WBL) concept, encompassing all forms of practical trainings in the private sector. Work-based Learning (WBL) was defined as: “learning that occurs when people do real work. This work can be paid or unpaid, but it must be real work that leads to the production of real goods and services.”<sup>13</sup>

To incorporate these changes, an annex to the TFF was drafted and approved by the Steering Committee in June 2015, including an adaptation of the implementation strategy. In accordance with it, a revised M&E framework was adopted, with a further limitation of the number of indicators.

The revised results (by inception study & theory of change workshop) were as followed:

- **Result 1:** At the national level relevant policy makers, private sector organisations and other Social Partners are capacitated and working together to facilitate and supervise the implementation of different work-based learning schemes
- **Result 2:** At the local level relevant stakeholders are capacitated and are implementing work-based learning
- **Result 3:** Economically and socially disadvantaged youth have improved access to training and coaching.

The Mid-Term Review (MTR) of June 2016 confirmed that the ECIB program was on the right track after the revision and is highly relevant for the TVET-LM subsector. The Mid-Term Review formulated

---

<sup>12</sup> Technical and Financial File, *Enhancing Capacities for Institution Building Program*, 2013, p. 6.

<sup>13</sup> European Training Foundation (ETF), *Work-Based Learning. A Handbook for Policy Makers and Social Partners in ETF Partner Countries*, 2014. For a more detailed discussion on the different types of apprenticeship and work-based learning schemes in Palestine: Horemans, B. & Hilal, R. (2017). *Closing the Gap: The Introduction of Work-based Learning Schemes in Palestine*. In: *TVET@Asia, Issue 9*, p. 1-14.

46 recommendations directed at the different stakeholders of the intervention: Ministries, Private Sector, BTC Palestine, BTC HQ and the PMT.

The intervention strategy was further adjusted to integrate the vast majority of the MTR recommendations resulting in a further optimisation of the implementation and the enhanced quality of the outputs and outcomes.<sup>14</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> See Results Report 2016 of the ECIB program.

## 2 Results achieved

### 2.1 Monitoring matrix

Results / indicators			Baseline Value	End Target	End value obtained	Comments
<b>IMPACT: Contribution is brought to State Building through enhancing the Palestinian capacities in view of institutional development</b>						
Percentage of youth with TVET qualification (PCBS data)			23,3%	28,3%	In process	PCBS Data on 2017 will only be published in October 2018
Sustainable nationally recognised body is facilitating and monitoring WBL for all systems at national level			0%	100%	90%	Y2: Prepared the ground through M&E committee (20%) Y3: informal inter-mediate structure is in place (60%) Y4: The body is endorsed formally, effective and sustainable (100%)
<b>OUTCOME: The institutional capacities of the beneficiary institutions involved in the apprenticeships scheme and in scholarships are improved</b>						
Number of WBL graduates, who conduct more than 30% structured field training in the work place	Overall		329	2000	3018	Achieved # refers to the number of graduates until June 2018 and includes all WBL graduates from Pilot, WBL program, Dual Studies and CVET Graduates from WBL programs without ECIB funding are not included
	Gender	Male	254	1544	1961	Achieved
		Female	75	436	1057	Achieved
	Location	West Bank	329	1500	2471	Achieved
		Gaza	0	500	547	Achieved
Percentage of WBL graduates who complete transition to employment or self-employment	Type of institution	TE graduates	49,1%	63%	86%	Achieved Results based on tracer study performed by Optimum using PCBS's definition of employment
		VE graduates	66,9%	86%	100%	Achieved
		VT graduates	68,5%	88%	94%	Achieved
TVET providers and Social Partners/PS representatives are	Macro-national level		0	3 annually	4+	Achieved

jointly engaged in monitoring WBL and developed policies <sup>15</sup>	Meso-national level		0	1-4 annually per governorate	4+	Achieved
	Micro-institute level		0	1-4 annually per institute	4+	Achieved
OUTPUT 1: At the national level relevant policy makers, private sector organisations and other social partners are capacitated and working together to facilitate and supervise the implementation of different work-based learning schemes						
A WBL strategy at the national level that provides for different WBL schemes is approved by relevant authorities with policies and regulations			0	100%	100%	Y2: Initiation of discussion stakeholders (20%) Y3.1: Drafting of strategy (50%) Y3.2: Approval of strategy (70%) Y4: Adoption of approved strategy (100%)
Laws and regulations are amended to enable WBL implementation			0	100%	80%	Y2: Initiation of discussion stakeholders (30%) Y3: Advocacy actions and formal communication to amend laws (60%) Y4: Modification of relevant laws and regulations (100%)
Number of policy level staff at central and decentralized level and social partners employees that are capacitated to facilitate and supervise WBL as a result of the intervention	Overall		0	100	182	Achieved
	Gender	Male	0	70	139	Achieved
		Female	0	30	43	Achieved
	Location	West Bank	0	80	171	Achieved
		Gaza	0	20	11	55% achieved
	Type of institution	Public Sector	0	70	119	Achieved
Private Sector		0	30	63	Achieved	
Pro-marginalised strategy and policies of scholarships are developed			0	100%	90%	Y2: Initiation discussions stakeholders (20%) Y3: Drafting strategy and circulation stakeholders (70%) Y4: Adoption of approved strategy and policies (100%) Recommendations have been made in the WBL strategy.

<sup>15</sup> TVET providers are: MOE/HE, MOL, MoSD, NGO VET league and UNRWA, the Social Partners mainly the private sector representatives (SP/PS representatives) are mainly the Chambers of Commerce and Industry (FPCCI and CCIs) and the PFI.

OUTPUT 2: At the local level, relevant stakeholders are capacitated and are implementing work-based learning						
Number of TVET institutes that are implementing formal and structural WBL	Overall		4	50	55	Achieved
	Location	West Bank	4	40	40	Achieved
		Gaza	0	10	15	Achieved
	Type of TVET institution	TC	0	12	15	Achieved
		SVS	2	16	12	75% achieved
		VTC	2	22	28	Achieved
Numbers of TVET Institutes that have Staff/ teachers/ trainers and Companies that have mentors capacitated to implement WBL	Type of institution	TVET institutes	4	58	48	83% achieved
		Companies	N/A	160	195	Achieved
Number of TVET institutes that adopt pro-poor, pro-marginalised and gender sensitive policies	Locality	WB	3	80%	70%	87,5% achieved
		Gaza	0	80%	90%	Achieved
OUTPUT 3: Economically and socially disadvantaged youth have improved access to training and coaching						
Number of recipients of scholarships	Overall		0	2000	2267	Scholarships were given to all trainees in WBL, pilot and as well as Dual Studies. <u>CVET and Evening Courses excluded.</u> 2267 without and 2784 with CVET and evening courses.
	Gender	Male	0	456	1432	Achieved 1432 without and 1822 with CVET and evening courses.
		Female	0	500	835	Achieved 835 without and 962 with CVET and evening courses.
	Location	West Bank	0	1000	1956	Achieved 1956 without and 2237 with CVET and evening courses.
		Gaza	0	500	311	62% achieved (no scholarships for CVET) 311 without and 547 with CVET and evening courses. Achieved
	Poverty level		0	1000	1010	1010 without and 1262 with CVET and evening courses. Excluding Juhoud
	Type of marginalisation	Area (EJ, Jordan Valley, Area C)	0	500	1068	Gaza also included as disadvantaged area Including Refugee Camps 1068 without and 1453 with CVET and evening courses. Achieved
		Difficult social circumstances	0	200	80	Because in CVET and Evening Courses there were no scholarships, the disadvantaged trainees from these courses were not included in this indicator and therefore the number only amounts to 80. If they would be included, the number of



						trainees with difficult circumstances would reach 278. This high number can be explained by the inclusion of a high number of trainees from Gaza in CVET. Excluding Dual Studies
		Disability	0	200	66	41% achieved 66 without and 81 with CVET and evening courses. Dual Studies not included
Approved follow-up and monitoring scheme for scholarship is implemented			0	100%	80%	Y2: Initiation of discussion with stakeholders (20%) Y3: Approval of scheme and final version action plan (70%) Y4: Approval approved scheme and implementation (100%)

## 2.2 Analysis of results

### 2.2.1 To what extent will the intervention contribute to the impact (potential impact)?

The initial general objective of the ECIB intervention was formulated in very general terms in the TFF: “Contribution is brought to State Building through enhancing the Palestinian capacities in view of institutional development.” For this reason, the general objective of the ECIB program has been further defined by the different stakeholders in a participatory workshop during the inception phase of the intervention as follows:

“Enhancing the capacities of youth for employment and economic development & (contributing to state building) through enhancing the institutional capacities and integrating the work place, its actors and its representatives in Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET).” (see Annex to TFF – Work Packages, 2015)

**Two indicators were defined to measure to what extent this desired impact will be reached by the intervention:**

- A nationally recognised structure facilitating coordination and cooperation between the different stakeholders in the TVET-LM subsector and creating a legal and institutional framework for Work-based Learning
- The percentage of youth with TVET qualification in Palestine

**On the achievement of the general objective or impact, The End-Term review (ETR) of the ECIB intervention, concludes the following:**

*“It is still premature to decide on the full impact the project will have, but on the basis of examples of the impact that the project is showing it can be given grade A. Many of the examples are on individual or local level but show positive trends and changes that are happening.*

*Continuous dialogue has been established between the TVET institutes and the private sector. Labour market studies that are carried out provide valuable information regarding not only the employment needs but also skills and competences that are needed.*

*TVET programs and initiatives that were implemented generally match better the needs of the labour market. Tracer studies are an important element as they follow the employment rate of students that participated in the WBL initiatives and provide valuable feedback for WBL programs developers and implementers.*

*Students that participated in the WBL initiatives feel empowered, are better prepared for the Labour Market and are often employed by companies where they took their WBL training.*

*There are positive examples of the empowerment of female students. The initiatives bring a more systemic approach to learning and work and affect both TVET institutes and private sector.*

*Awareness is built in companies regarding safety, health issues, organisation of work and support to the students in the practical part of their training. Capacities are also built in the private sector as it provides mentors that are trained by the project, which is also an added value to the company.*

*The project provided institutional empowerment of TVET institutes and staff and provided continuous coaching over the period of the implementation.” (ETR, p. 7)*

**The ETR continuous in the same vein, on the question of relevance:**

*“The ECIB program is still very relevant for Palestine as it is in line with the priorities and development policies of the Palestinian government at the national and local level as well as with priorities of the Belgian government and EU. The Integrated Strategic Program for Employment in Palestine foresees the central role for TVET, including work-based learning and entrepreneurship training. The draft strategy and legislation provide a framework for the implementation of the work-based learning into TVET and the institutional arrangements, with the Higher Council and the establishment of the*

*Development Centre, which role is still not clear. Approval of both documents would provide a clear step forward towards a modern TVET system. According to the information received this will be done by the latest in May 2018, before the end of the ECIB program.” (ETR, p. 40)*

The reservation made during the *ETR* mission which took place in the second half of February 2018 was justified at the time, as the approval of the WBL strategy and legal framework was still pending. Meanwhile, the WBL strategy has been formally adopted by both the Joint Management Structure for TVET-LM, including both Ministries (MoEHE, MoL), the private sector partners (FPCCIA, PFI) and the Higher Council for TVET. At the same time, it was decided to approve the draft WBL legislation, but instead of presenting it as such to the Cabinet for adoption, the WBL legal provision will be integrated as bylaw in the new TVET law which is in preparation.

A second positive evolution since the *ETR* concerns the Higher Council for TVET and the Development Center. Upon special request of both the Ministers of MoEHE and MoL as rotating presidents of the Higher Council, a TVET high-level “workshop” was organised on 12 April 2018 for all TVET stakeholders and the donor community to present and discuss the new TVET architecture in Palestine. The – complex - general architecture for TVET will include 4 Ministries (MoEHE, MoL, MoSD and MoWA), the Private Sector (FPCCAI, PFI), NGOs active in TVET and apart from the Development Center some specialised entities such as the Curriculum Center, the Palestinian Fund for Employment and Social Protection (PFESP), the Local Employment and TVET (LET) Councils.

The structure foresees also a specialised training center for TVET teachers, trainers and mentors, similar to the long-established National Institute for Educational Training (NIET), but which only covers educational training for general education. Such (a) training center(s) would indeed remediate one of the current main obstacles of providing quality of TVET in Palestine. Less than 1 out of 5 TVET teachers or trainers is properly pedagogically trained to teach or train students. This number is considerably lower than this of teachers in general education.<sup>16</sup> GIZ has recently started an EU co-funded extensive Train the Trainer (TTT) program for TVET teachers/trainers, which will substantially contribute to quality improvement of TVET in Palestine.

The mission of the newly established Development Center for TVET have been defined in detail by the Higher Council for TVET as well as the 8 main tasks of the center:

*“To promote the role of TVET within the Palestinian society, and to contribute to achieving sustainable development by matching supply and demand in the labor market locally, regionally and internationally. It has to respond to any requirements in order to achieve this i.e. in terms of standards of quality and the development of programs, systems and human resources in partnership with the concerned governmental agencies, civil society organisations and the private sector institutions.”<sup>17</sup>*

For the immediate future, the following task were presented by the newly appointed head of the Development Center, Dr. Anwar Zakaria:

- Status analysis of TVET in Palestine and updating TVET strategy
- Set TVET legislation frame and regulations
- Development of a Palestinian Quality Framework for TVET
- Investment in training of teachers and trainers
- Development of a TVET information system and database
- Promotion of labor market involvement

It seems justified to conclude that the ECIB program has significantly contributed to the revitalisation of the since long dormant TVET architecture and the creation of a nationally recognised structure which facilitates coordination and cooperation between the different stakeholders in the TVET-LM subsector and creates a legal and institutional framework for Work-based Learning.

---

<sup>16</sup> For more data on this and similar topics see: *M&E Report 2016 of the MoEHE*.

<sup>17</sup> Presentation by the new head of the Development Center, Dr. Anwar Zakaria during TVET Workshop.

As for the second objective to increase the percentage of youth with TVET qualification in Palestine, we can equally conclude that the ECIB program has created a renewed interest for TVET in the public and private sector. Representing less than 3% of the total student population in Palestine, it is almost natural that TVET was never a high priority for the MoEHE. What the MoL is concerned, vocational training is only one of its many tasks, and the number of students enrolled in their centers is limited to a couple of thousand people. But also the private sector, because of the existing skills mismatch and the lack of clear coordination mechanisms to foster cooperation with the TVET institutes and the Ministries, showed little interest in TVET. As a result, TVET led a marginalised and chronically underfunded existence, scattered over different Ministries and some private initiatives of NGOs or local governments as was the case in Hebron. This seems to have changed now: TVET has become a priority of both the Ministries and the private sector and WBL because of its practical approach to close the skills gap, has certainly played an important role in this paradigm shift.

## **2.2.2 To what extent has the outcome been achieved? Explain.**

### **Outcome 1: The institutional capacities of the beneficiary institutions involved in the apprenticeships scheme and in scholarships are improved**

**Graduates:** During the ECIB program, 3018 graduates have been trained in the private sector according to WBL regulations over the course of the intervention, while the original target was only 2000. This number is a compilation of graduates from the WBL pilot, the WBL program, the Dual Studies program as well as graduates in CVET and Evening Courses that had a WBL component.

**Employment:** According to tracer study data collected by consultancy firm Optimum, 93% of WBL graduates from ECIB initiatives have found employment between 6 months and 1 year after graduation. The targets of this indicator have been achieved in all types of institutes: Technical Colleges, Secondary Vocational Schools and Vocational Training Centres. It should be noted, however, that in order to make the results comparable with PCBS data on the employment rate of TVET graduates, on which the indicator targets are based, Optimum used a similar methodology of sampling as well as operated the same definition of employment as PCBS where employment is defined as any kind of paid labour that is performed at least 1 hour per week.<sup>18</sup> These very high numbers should for this reason be treated with caution. Rather than looking at the absolute numbers, it has to be seen as a clear indication that WBL has contributed to a sharp increase in the employment of TVET graduates, reaching up to 40%, more than 10% above the target. An explanation for this excellent result can be found in the WBL scheme that is a strong tool in facilitating the transition from school to work through the integration of a real work experience during the education/training. Instead of a sharp break between the two, it creates more of a continuum. Students gain important technical skills directly adapted to the needs of the labour market. Even more important, they learn what it is to work in a company. These are life skills very hard to learn at school or the training center. Also, the private sector benefits since it is in its companies where the graduates will be hired as employees. Hence, the employers will save money and time if they can hire young people who are better trained in skills relevant for the labour market and have prior work experience.

**Strategic meetings:** TVET providers and private sector representatives were noted to engage frequently in joint meetings to discuss TVET and WBL related issues, both on a macro national level between Ministries and Chambers, Unions or Associations, as well as on meso governorate level and the micro level between TVET institutes and their private sector partners. On the macro and meso level, Enabel staff was often present to participate in these discussions.

**Conclusion:** On a national level, TVET providers are capacitated to govern WBL. They now operate a functional WBL strategy, legislation and manual and engage in frequent meetings to discuss TVET and WBL related issues through the reactivated Higher Council for TVET and the Development Center. On a local level, WBL structures have been piloted and established in 51 TVET institutes in addition to the 4 TVET institutes that were already implementing WBL before the start of the intervention. These institutes received initial capacity building trainings and acquired over the course of the intervention

---

<sup>18</sup> Hilal, R. *WBL Initiatives' Graduates' Tracer Study Report, 2018.*

the necessary experience to implement WBL. Since 2014, more than 3000 trainees graduated from WBL initiatives in these institutes, of which 93% found employment. 94% of TVET institutes stated they felt capacitated and willing to continue WBL in the future.<sup>19</sup>

### 2.2.3 To what extent have outputs been achieved? Explain

#### **Output 1: At the national level relevant policy makers, private sector organisations and other social partners are capacitated and working together to facilitate and supervise the implementation of different work-based learning schemes**

**WBL Strategy:** A national WBL Strategy has been developed and approved by all relevant stakeholders on a national level. Over the course of 2017, a series of workshops were organised by consultancy firm Optimum in cooperation with Enabel, involving all relevant stakeholders and partners in TVET. Based on these workshops and the feedback of the stakeholders, a WBL Strategy was drafted and evaluated by the ministries and social partners on the national level. In June 2018, this strategy was officially approved by the relevant Ministries (MoL, MoEHE) and the private sector. The Higher Council for TVET approved the WBL Strategy in August 2018.

**WBL Legislation:** In 2018, a set of WBL bylaws were developed in cooperation with all the TVET stakeholders and national and international legislators and a final proposal was approved in June 2018. Instead of being adopted as such by the legislator, these WBL bylaws will be integrated in the new TVET law which is in preparation.

**Capacitated policy level staff:** Over the course of the intervention, 182 national policy level staff have been capacitated with the knowledge and skills to facilitate and manage WBL on the governmental and national level. These capacity building workshops were organised by consultancy company Optimum over the course of 2016. In these workshops, Enabel actively encouraged the inclusion of women, Gaza and the private sector partners. All targets were achieved, apart from Gaza where only 11 persons participated in the workshops.<sup>20</sup>

**Pro-marginalized strategy:** A pro-marginalized strategy and policies have been developed as part of the national WBL Strategy.

**Conclusion:** Stakeholders on the national level have been capacitated and are actively engaged with the institutionalisation of the WBL scheme in TVET institutes in Palestine. In addition to this, a Joint Management Structure has been put in place with a Higher Council for TVET and a Development Center as its executive arm to manage and coordinate all issues regarding TVET and ensure continuing advocacy for TVET in Palestine.

#### **Output 2: At the local level, relevant stakeholders<sup>21</sup> are capacitated and are implementing work-based learning**

**TVET institutes implementing WBL:** Over the course of the program, 51 TVET institutes were capacitated to implement the WBL scheme in addition to 4 institutes that were already implementing structural WBL in their TVET institutes. Throughout the ECIB program, 82 WBL initiatives and 31 CVET initiatives were implemented.<sup>22</sup>

**TVET and PS staff capacitated:** 329 staff members from 48 TVET institutes received capacity building trainings on WBL by the consultancy company Optimum. In addition to this, 195 companies received capacity building from the Belgian agency for entrepreneurship and SME training, Syntra. Through these trainings as well as the experience of WBL itself, the participating TVET institutes and

---

<sup>19</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Final M&E Report on ECIB WBL initiatives in Palestine*, Enabel, 2018.

<sup>20</sup> Hilal, R. *Final Report for: "Coaching, Monitoring & Evaluation of 75 Work-based Learning Initiatives in Palestine."* Period Feb 2016-Jan 2018, p. 10v.

<sup>21</sup> Stakeholders are 1) TVET providers: MOEHE, MOL, MOSD, UNRWA and NGO League, 2) TVET Social Partners, being the Private sector representatives: Chambers and PFI, 3) involved companies.

<sup>22</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Idem*.



private sector companies stated to understand the best practices in organizing WBL and to have the necessary experience to continue WBL in the future.<sup>23</sup>

**Pro-disadvantaged strategies:** The ECIB program has created more awareness of pro-disadvantaged strategies in TVET through the implementation of the Scholarship Fund. However, much of the sustainability of this pro-disadvantaged approach lies in continued funding, especially to support poor trainees and trainees from disadvantaged areas. The majority of participating TVET institutes were governmental and therefore tuition free, which means that the majority of their trainees are from a poor or disadvantaged backgrounds. On the other hand, nearly all private TVET institutes had specific measures to deal with trainees who could not afford the tuition fees. Additionally, a greater awareness was created on the participation of female and disabled trainees. 69% of TVET institutes in the West Bank and 90% of institutes in Gaza stated to have policies that supported the participation of disadvantaged trainees. In the future, a pro-disadvantaged strategy will be implemented on the national level through the WBL Strategy, further encouraging the participation of disadvantaged trainees in TVET and WBL.<sup>24</sup>

**Conclusion:** Participating TVET institutes and private sector companies on the local level are capacitated to implement WBL and gained the appropriate experience to continue WBL in the future that is inclusive to disadvantaged trainees. 94% of the TVET institutes stated they were willing to continue the WBL scheme, 71% already had concrete plans to continue in the future, 69% were already continuing and 62% of the TVET institutes already expanded WBL to other vocations in their schools.<sup>25</sup>

### **Output 3: Economically and socially disadvantaged youth have improved access to training and coaching**

**Scholarships:** Scholarships were given to all trainees in the WBL pilot, WBL and elected Dual Studies programs to support their participation in the WBL courses. In the end, scholarships were given to 2267 trainees, of which 37% women, 45% poor trainees and 47% coming from a disadvantaged area. The scholarships included financial support with transportation, tuition fees, tool kits and uniforms for the trainees. An additional Special Fund was given to 546 trainees that were especially disadvantaged.<sup>26</sup>

**M&E Scholarships:** The M&E system for TVET will be improved through the existence of the new Development Center, which will include data gathering on the background and gender of the trainees as well as their access to TVET. Additionally, there will be a WBL fund co-financed by the public and private sector, which will allow financial support to disadvantaged trainees in the future.

**General output:** Disadvantaged trainees make up the majority of governmental TVET trainees in the Gaza Strip and the West Bank and should therefore receive additional support. 49% of ECIB trainees came from a disadvantaged area (Area C, Seam Zone, East Jerusalem and Gaza), 45% came from a poor or very poor background and 35% of trainees were women. Through the ECIB scholarship scheme, an increased number of disadvantaged trainees were able to participate in the program.<sup>27, 28</sup>

## **2.2.4 To what extent did outputs contribute to the achievement of the outcome**

On all levels the capacities of the TVET providers were strengthened to implement and manage a qualitative and sustainable WBL scheme that was inclusive to disadvantaged trainees. Both on the national level and local level, the principle actors gained a relevant and positive experience with WBL and are committed to continue this scheme in the future.

The outputs of the intervention contributed directly to the achievement of the outcomes. This was made possible because of the revision of the initial Logframe and the development of a series of work packages based on the extended inception study and the participatory Theory of Change workshop. The further adjustment of the intervention strategy based on the MTR recommendations, led to a further

---

<sup>23</sup> Hilal, R. *WBL Initiatives' Graduates' Tracer Study Report*, 2018.

<sup>24</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Idem*.

<sup>25</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>26</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>27</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>28</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Final M&E Report on ECIB CVET Initiatives*, Enabel, 2018.

optimisation of the implementation and the alignment of the outputs with the desired outcomes. Activities and outputs that were not instrumental to reach the outcomes were cancelled or interrupted.

### **2.2.5 Assess the most important influencing factors. What were major issues encountered? How were they addressed by the intervention?**

The most important decisions that led to the success of the ECIB program were:

1. To revise the original Logframe to make it more adapted to the context of Palestine and the reality in the field. Instead of starting with the capacity building of the TVET stakeholders before the roll out of the pilot, it was decided to start with the WBL pilot and to organise the capacity building programs along the way, so that the beneficiaries could practise the information and tools they received directly.
2. To create a joint management team with all the TVET stakeholders to tackle the fragmentation of TVET in Palestine. This *ad hoc* informal structure created the necessary framework to launch the WBL program, to assure the follow up by the partners and created the foundations for the new united TVET governance structure in Palestine (see also chapter 3: Sustainability)
3. To open a field office in Gaza, which created the necessary impetus to roll out the program in the Gaza Strip. This assured a quality follow up of the WBL initiatives and the involvement of the TVET stakeholders in the Gaza Strip in the development of the institutional framework. The creation of a coordination structure similar to the one in the West Bank with the three main international partners (GIZ, IRPAL and Enabel) assured the necessary coordination between the programs of the three actors and facilitated the organisations of joint activities such as the TVET week, summer camps, entrepreneurship training, promotion and awareness campaigns etc.

### **2.2.6 Assess the unexpected results, both negative and positive ones**

**The following positive side-effects were generated during the implementation of the intervention:**

1. The introduction of the WBL scheme on a national level resulted in a decrease of the widespread informal company-based apprenticeship schemes in Palestine: *“The WBL initiatives would build the culture, provide the resources and know-how within the TVET institutes as well as among the employers for dual arrangements that could be utilized for future formalisation of the company-based apprenticeship, and provide a formalised substitute for the informal apprenticeship especially in city centres where they operate.”*<sup>29</sup> There are clear deficits in informal company-based apprenticeship schemes with regard to the Decent Work Agenda of the ILO including unsafe working conditions, insufficient social protection in case of illness and strong gender imbalances. Informal apprenticeship is also not clearly covered by law and mentors as well as owners, apprentices and skilled workers have only a minimum understanding of existing legislation. In most cases there are only verbal agreements between the apprentice and mentor. By contrast, WBL offers better pedagogical support, legal protection and an official recognition of skills (certificates)<sup>30</sup>
2. The creation of a pilot training fund by the Federation of Palestinian Chambers of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture (FPCCIA) based on a minimal obligatory contribution of the members. Although for the most part symbolic, it can help to change the mindset of the private sector that skills development is the sole responsibility of the government who has to bear all the costs together with the international donors. Still far removed from a national or sectoral training fund, it can be seen as a first step and contributes to the increasing awareness of the private sector of its societal responsibility (corporate social responsibility – CRS)

---

<sup>29</sup> Hilal, R. *Assessment of Informal Apprenticeship in Palestine, 2016, Ramallah-Palestine*, p.59.

<sup>30</sup> Horemans, B. & Hilal, R. (2017). *Closing the Gap: The Introduction of Work-based Learning Schemes in Palestine*. in: *TVET@Asia*, issue 9, p. 1-14.



3. During the implementation of the WBL program, it became clear that WBL was by itself not able to close the existing skills gap and skills mismatch in Palestine. The private sector encounters itself great difficulties in keeping up with the technological evolution due to a limited access to specialised training. In most cases, WBL graduates still lack the necessary entrepreneurial skills to start their own business in a successful way. In discussions with both groups, the intervention decided to extend the WBL scheme from initial TVET to Continuous Vocational Education and Training (CVET) offering skills upscaling and upgrading for private sector employers, employees and jobseekers including lifelong learning schemes to increase the competitiveness of the Palestinian private sector. At the same time the intervention integrated entrepreneurship courses in both the TVET and CVET and offered business development support to employers and starters
4. The above-mentioned new united TVET governance structure generated nearly immediately and unforeseen decision by the DG TVET of the MoEHE to offer vocational training in their schools to find a solution for the chronic shortage of space in the VTCs. Another decision of the same directorate general was to revise the decision to build a new training hotel as annex to a new technical school and to opt instead for a close cooperation with the existing hotels in Ramallah. The DG TVET of the MoL was able to equip and staff a new VTC in Salfiet after Enabel facilitated contacts between the ministry and the private sector
5. A WBL graduate Ameen from Jenin VTC in painting and decoration, participated in the WorldSkills competition in Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates, after winning the national competition. Thanks to him Palestine was ranked among the world's top ten countries in painting and decoration. This Olympic Games for vocational skills gave a real boost to TVET in Palestine.

**The intervention generated some negative side-effects as well:**

- 72% of TVET institutes believe that their private sector partners would want to continue WBL without external funding.<sup>31</sup> Many TVET institutes had already a relationship with the private sector and the WBL scheme helped to further improve and institutionalize this relationship. In some cases, however, the private sector companies asked for financial compensation for their participation in WBL, even if they did not receive any compensation in the past
- The high number of female trainees and trainees from Gaza lowered the overall employment percentages of the WBL graduates within the ECIB program. In addition to that, the inclusion of Gaza led to lower sustainability figures of WBL because of the difficult social, political and economic situation in Gaza.<sup>32</sup>

## **2.2.7 Assess the Integration of Transversal Themes in the intervention strategy**

### **1. Gender**

Gender has been a transversal theme throughout the entire ECIB program, which put a strong emphasis on the promotion of female participation in TVET.<sup>33</sup> The following measures were developed in this perspective.<sup>34</sup>

- The Baseline Study was gender sensitive, and looked into developing Work-based Learning (WBL) schemes integrating a strong gender perspective
- Gender-sensitive indicators were integrated in the M&E framework from the start of the intervention
- Specific attention was given to innovative gender-sensitive awareness-raising campaigns to promote women to enrol in TVET beyond gender stereotypes

---

<sup>31</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Idem*.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>33</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Analysis of Gender in ECIB Program, Enabel, 2018.*

<sup>34</sup> Horemans, B. *Results Report 2016 Enhancing Capacities for Institution Building Program. Enabel, 2017.*

- WBL and CVET courses that were inclusive to women were encouraged in the application guidelines and through the selection of the initiatives
- A matching pro-gender and pro-poor Scholarship Fund was linked to the WBL Fund to tackle the low number of female trainees and graduates in TVET and promote the participation of women in the WBL program
- The development of a gender strategy for the TVET-LM sector.

The results show clearly that the approach adopted by the ECIB program had a strong positive impact on the enrolment of female trainees in the participating TVET institutes. The gender sensitive awareness-raising campaigns and the positive discrimination policy towards female candidates of the Scholarship Fund have strongly contributed to this result and is a proof of the effective gender policy the ECIB program adopted.

Through the gender-sensitivity of the indicators, it was also guaranteed that at least 23% of those benefitting from the ECIB's capacity building trainings on a macro and meso level were women.

It was also considered essential that at least 23% of the WBL trainees and recipients of scholarships were female. At the end of 2018, 1057 female trainees graduated from the WBL program organised by ECIB representing 35% of the total number of graduates surpassing significantly the objective of 23%. A similar result has been obtained for the scholarships: More than 37% of scholarships were granted to women<sup>35</sup>

Additionally, the ECIB program developed and implemented a gender-sensitive communication plan and organised innovative gender-sensitive awareness-raising campaigns while taking great care in reaching, in particular women, in its communication. Many success stories of female graduates who found (self-)employment were highlighted through the different communication channels of the program (see chapter on tools and products).

## 2. Environment

In accordance with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the priorities of the Belgian Development Cooperation, environmental sustainability has been integrated as a transversal theme during the implementation of the ECIB program, which made significant efforts to raise environmental awareness among its stakeholders and adopted an environmental policy in all its activities and in relation with its partners.<sup>36</sup>

In the context of Palestine, environment is often not regarded as a priority because of the existing social, economic, political and security issues.<sup>37</sup> In order to guarantee the integration of an environmental component in the WBL and CVET courses and to encourage the development of environmentally-friendly courses, ECIB included a component on environment in its guidelines and in its evaluation criteria of the WBL and CVET initiative proposals. ECIB supported initiatives that promote the integration of environmental topics on several levels, such as:

- The integration of environmental topics in the curricula used in the WBL schemes
- The promotion of WBL initiatives in the domain of green economy: solar systems, waste management, green technology, recycling, green alternatives, etc.
- The integration of environmental criteria in the call for WBL proposals.

In the call for proposal and guidelines for Continuous Vocational Education and Training (CVET), the ECIB program went a step further and required that the beneficiary included environmental education in its program as well as a course on occupational health and safety (OHS).<sup>38</sup>

This resulted in a number of environmental courses as well as the integration of environmental sensibility as a transversal theme during the implementation of the WBL and CVET courses. As a result,

<sup>35</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Analysis of Gender in ECIB Program*.

<sup>36</sup> Mostinckx, L. (2018). *Analysis of Environment in ECIB Program*. Enabel.

<sup>37</sup> Isaac, J. *Environmental Protection & Sustainable Development in Palestine. Our Shared Environment Applied Research Institute, Jerusalem (ARIJ)*, 1994.

<sup>38</sup> Horemans; B. *Results Report 2016 Enhancing Capacities for Institution Building Program*. Enabel, 2016.

several environmental courses were implemented on solar energy, hybrid cars and recycling. In addition to this, in CVET 69% of TVET institutes included a course on environmental awareness in their curriculum and 80% took environmental sustainability into account by using environmental-friendly material, recycling or upcycling and the maintenance of their machinery, equipment or devices.

## **2.2.8 To what extent have M&E, backstopping activities To what extent have M&E, backstopping activities and/or audits contributed to the attainment of results? How were recommendations dealt with?**

The backstopping missions that took place have been crucial for the attainment of the results and the success of the intervention. Thanks to these missions, the initial Logframe and theory of change of the intervention were modified to be better adapted to the local reality and to make maximal use of the existing opportunities. The backstopping missions were indispensable occasions to reflect on the progress of the intervention and to adapt and refine the implementation strategy and to launch innovative approaches to further improve the overall quality of the intervention. During these backstopping missions, the Logframe and indicators as proposed in the original TFF were reviewed and adapted. An inception study initiated in 2014 provided the baseline data for the revised indicators.

The Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Framework was specifically designed for the program and adapted in function of new insights based on the inception report. This led to the development of a set of work packages.; It allowed for a close monitoring of all ongoing activities and evaluation of intermediary results, hence assuring the overall quality and a result-oriented steering of the program.

During the implementation of the intervention there was continuous internal monitoring and evaluation of the intervention activities as well as two external evaluations.

There was continuous quantitative and qualitative M&E follow-up, which led to a complete database of participating TVET institutes, private sector companies and trainees. As not all aspects of the WBL initiatives could be captured with the quantitative indicators, additional follow-up was initiated of the qualitative experience of TVET institutes with WBL and CVET. These data were collected by means of field visits and interviews, which gave insight into the experience of all actors involved, including problems and best practices. These field visits also offered the opportunity for TVET institutes to mention any difficulties they might face, which could then be resolved by the PMT. The data collected during these visits and interviews were summarized in a progress and final M&E report for further use in new interventions.

Additionally, two external evaluations took place of the intervention. The recommendations made during the mid-term review were discussed with the PMT and Enabel and subsequently implemented. The End-term Review provided a very positive evaluation of the intervention and a set of recommendations and lessons learned which will be extremely useful for similar interventions focussing on improving the labour-market relevance of TVET.

In total, three audits took place during the implementation of the intervention. They provided useful recommendations to further improve the financial-administrative control and the design and operating effectiveness of the Internal Control System. The PMT in close cooperation with Enabel in Palestine as well as HQ put in place additional control and management tools based on these audit reports. An additional staff member was hired to support the financial and administrative officer in her duties resulting in a better separation of duties and administrative follow up of grant agreements.

## 3 Sustainability

### 3.1.1 What is the economic and financial viability of the results of the intervention? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?

*“There are elements in the project implementation that support the sustainability of the project results. There is a sense of ownership of the results of the project, both in TVET institutes and in the private sector. TVET institutes have been building their capacity in the development and implementation of the WBL in partnership with the private sector and some are extending it to other programs using their own resources. New programs are developed in the TVET institutes based on the labour market needs. WBL is perceived as the effective tool to serve the demands of the labour market. Awareness building about the opportunities that TVET offers is an important element in attracting students. Sustainability is also enhanced through the documents that were produced during the program implementation.” (ETR, p. 9)*

**The End-term Review gives a number of elements that has a positive impact on the sustainability of the intervention beyond the lifetime of the intervention:**

- There is the sense of ownership of the results of the project, both in TVET institutes and in the private sector. Initiatives that have been implemented are result of joint efforts of the two partners
- TVET institutes have been building their capacity in the development and implementation of the WBL in partnership with the PS and some are extending it to other programs using their own resources. The project is focused on the capacity development as a mechanism that would provide sustainability in the longer term. Training activities are focused on coordinators, mentors and Master Craftsperson (with the provision of ToT). The trained staff both in the TVET institutes and in the PS represent a pool of experts that can be used to further extend trainings to other programs and sectors
- New programs are developed in the TVET institutes based on the labour market needs. TVET institutes see an opportunity to expand, to better match the needs of the labour market and to offer programs that give trainees better chances for employment. In many case some programs that are offered as formal programs in TVET schools are developed and offered as shorter programs or courses in VTCs.
- WBL is perceived as an effective tool to accommodate to the demands of the labour market. This is seen as such both in TVET institutes and companies from the private sectors. Companies can directly see the benefit as they follow and support trainees in the practical part of their training and have the possibility to give immediate feedback to the training institution.
- Awareness building about the opportunities that TVET offers is an important element in attracting trainees. Examples of good practices and success stories and in particular employment opportunities for graduates may raise interest for TVET
- Sustainability is also enhanced through the documents that were produced during the program implementation, such as the WBL Strategy, legislation and manual
- Sustainability depends on the resources that are needed to continue activities that were developed. Some centres continued to apply the WBL from their own funds and some of them opened new programs without any external support. Even some companies expressed readiness to cover cost, which shows that they saw their benefit in the WBL scheme<sup>39</sup>

---

<sup>39</sup> More specifically:

- There are cases where graduates from the project are ready to support the WBL approach in workshops and during awareness campaigns. (*ETR*, p. 28-9)

**There are some conditions that affects the sustainability negatively:**

- The TVET sector in Palestine is fragmented. The responsibility for TVET is split among different Ministries, mainly the MoL and MoEHE with a lack of sufficient coordination and cooperation. This is also due to a lack of capacities (managerial, operational and financial). However, the MoEHE is recently investing more means in the TVET sector
- The Higher Council for TVET and the underlying governance structures, in particular the Development Centre should in the future contribute to the reduction of this fragmentation. The Thematic Working Group for TVET and Employment, established in 2016 within the framework of the Reformed Education Sector Working Group (ESWG), was another attempt to overcome the fragmentation. According to the changes in legislation the Higher Council for TVET will be responsible for TVET
- The Ministry of Labour, although a crucial actor in the whole TVET-LM subsector, does not have the necessary means and capacities at the moment to take the leading role in TVET. The private sector is still not fully aware of the role it can and should play in this subsector
- At the moment there is still no legal framework for WBL, neither for TVET. One of the work packages of the ECIB program is therefore to provide support for the development of the legal basis for WBL. Most of the preparatory work has been done. It will depend on the will of the Palestinian government to finalise the work and develop a bylaw on WBL as part of a more comprehensive TVET law
- Financing of the WBL is an important issue that has to be taken seriously as it is in the very core of the WBL. As the practical part of the training is carried out in companies, insurance, transportation, and possible incentives must be provided. Insurance is an important element as students are out of TVET institutes and accidents might happen. Transportation is also an expense for students in particular if the private company is far from their residence. Most of TVET students come from the poor or de-privileged areas and this cost is important and should be covered
- Local hubs for coordination of the WBL should be (re)established. LET councils were created by GIZ to provide support and coordination between the public and the private sector in the field of skills development. Only three are functional at the moment (Hebron, Ramallah and Nablus)
- The project used a pro-gender and pro-poor approach to attract students to participate in the WBL initiatives. Scholarships that were provided allowed students to enrol in the programs. Most of them wouldn't be able to participate without a scholarship which is also an important aspect for the sustainability
- During the program implementation a management structure was developed that also included five thematic working groups. For the institutionalisation of the system it would be important that those TWG will be integrated in the Development Centre.

We can find many elements that support the sustainability of the intervention beyond the lifespan of the intervention and others that undermines it. We can conclude that the intervention was successful in

- 
- 94% of the TVET institutes stated they were willing to continue the WBL scheme
  - 71% already had concrete plans to continue in the future
  - 69% were already continuing
  - 62% of the TVET institutes already expanded WBL to other vocations in their schools

*See Mostinckx L. Final M&E Report on ECIB WBL initiatives in Palestine Initiatives.*



laying a strong foundation for a national WBL scheme in Palestine, certainly taken into account the short time frame of 2,5 years of the actual roll out of the WBL pilot. At the same time, for most stakeholders, it was not more than a first experience with WBL and not all the aspects of it are fully understood by everyone. Therefore, a second round of WBL with a coaching by Enabel remains necessary to consolidate what was achieved.

### **3.1.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?**

*“There is a strong feeling of ownership of the project in both ministries, the focal points and in the Thematic Working Groups. The ownership is in particular strong in TVET institutes that developed the new initiatives and established links with the private sector. The WBL approach offered them a window of opportunity to provide TVET of higher quality, based on the local labour market needs and also develop their own capacities. Some TVET institutes continued the development of the new programs on their own as it gives them a comparative advantage on the market.” (ETR, p. 12)*

This ownership has been fostered during the entire life-cycle of the intervention as an explicit objective. The following actions have strongly contributed to this sense of ownership among the partners:

- The revision of the original Logframe during a participatory Theory of Change workshop involving all stakeholders at the national and local level and the joint formulation of a series of work packages
- The organisation of workshops bringing all the stakeholder together at the central and local level at each important stage of the intervention to discuss the concrete implementation, to develop new tools and methodologies or to define strategies
- To allow for a certain degree of flexibility in the implementation of the WBL initiatives so that the partners could adapt the proposed methodology to their own reality and come up with innovative ideas and creative solutions to tackle the many problems they encountered in implementing the new WBL scheme
- An extensive capacity development program for all the public and private partners at the national, regional and local level
- A robust M&E system assuring a continuous monitoring of the roll out of the WBL initiatives by the partners during field visits and allowing for short feedback loops to address problems and suggest solutions in a timely manner.

Although many partners have decided to continue with WBL without direct (financial) support of the intervention, the risk remains substantial that the partners will not succeed in retaining the same quality of the initiatives under their own management. WBL can be considered as a cost-saving scheme wherein the cost per trainee is lower as he/she spends more time in the private sector and hence there is less need to invest in workshops, equipment and machines. However, there are still costs that have to be covered such as: transport of trainees and teachers/trainers to the private sector, insurance, work clothes, tools, etc. TVET institutes and the Ministries in charge of TVET have to foresee these expenses in their budgets even if the cost per student will be lower.

For the TVET institutes it will not always be evident to convince the private sector to participate in the WBL scheme without the direct tangible benefit they received during the ECIB program. To count on the private sector to invest in WBL because of the long-term benefits it will bring them or to point out their societal responsibility (corporate social responsibility) might be simply too much to ask for.

We have to conclude that the ECIB program was too short to assure the complete ownership by the partners of the WBL scheme. The institutional framework has only been formally adopted mid-2018 and there are not yet national or sectoral training funds to cover the costs of WBL. The initiative of the FPCCIA to collect a small contribution of their members for training is praiseworthy but will not solve the problem. A second intervention is needed to create real ownership by all the partners.

### **3.1.3 What was the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?**

During the lifespan of the intervention, there was an increasing interest and support at the national and local policy level. An important milestone in this process was the creation of the Joint Management Team for TVET and the creation of the five thematic working groups to coordinate the actions of all the TVET stakeholders. This *ad hoc* informal structure lay the foundations for the reactivation of the Higher Council and the creation of the Development Center. Both Ministries and the private sector are working actively together to build a unified TVET governance structure in Palestine. Most of the building blocks are now in place or in the final stage of preparation. It is unlikely that the stakeholders would have managed to build this structure without the creation of this Joint Management Team. Proof of this can be found in the persistence of the JMT notwithstanding the many clashes between the two Ministries. Ongoing disputes were brought to the JMT and debated until a solution was found. Many unilateral decisions taken by ministers were revoked after discussion within the JMT.

However, things are far from consolidated: The presentation of the newly unified TVET governance structure dates only from April 2018, laws and regulations are still missing and the Development Center is not yet fully operational.

Now the ECIB program has come to an end and a new intervention is still in preparation, it is extremely important that the other stakeholders, and in particular GIZ, keep the fire burning and offer full support to the new and still fragile unified TVET governance structure.

### **3.1.4 How well has the intervention contributed to institutional and management capacity? What are potential risks? What measures were taken?**

An important component of the intervention was to build the capacity of the different stakeholders involved in the implementation of the WBL scheme. An extensive capacity building facility combining a mixture of formal and informal training was developed to this end. Staff members of Ministries and TVET institutes as well as representatives of private sector organisations, company owners and their personnel participated in tailor-made capacity building programs as discussed in detail above. (See 2.2.2 and 2.2.3)

Two major risks are intrinsically linked to each capacity building program, namely that the presented information and tools are not used or that the beneficiaries of the program leave their organisation or receive different responsibilities unrelated to the objective of the intervention.

To prevent this, the intervention took the following measures:

- Applying a learning by doing methodology whereby the beneficiaries are capacitated during their work while followed by a coach
- The intervention made sure that always more than 1 person of each entity (department, company, etc.) benefitted from the capacity building program so that the institutional knowledge was not lost
- After the completion of the institutional knowledge all material was made available in printed form and published on different websites for further use.



## 4 Learning

### 4.1 Lessons Learned

Lessons learned on the general operational level of Enabel	
TFF Revision	The Technical and Financial File was developed well in advance of the actual start of the intervention. The situation changes however considerably in a volatile context as Palestine. Because of this, the TFF does not allow direct implementation of intervention activities. It is important to consider that an intervention really starts with a well-planned baseline study, over a period up to six months. This baseline study would allow familiarisation of the intervention team with the local situation and the existing dynamics in the relevant sectors. On the basis of a participatory Theory of Change workshop bringing together all relevant stakeholders, a realistic change process can be defined for the design of the intervention. Based on this, a logical framework and matching M&E framework, including pertinent qualitative and quantitative indicators can be developed.
Cooperation with other donors	In nearly all cases, different donors and agencies are active in a country providing support in a particular (sub)sector, addressing the same issues, actors and beneficiaries, but applying different methodologies and procedures. Often valuable resources are lost due to uncoordinated (or even competitive) operations and local actors are overburdened by administrative demands. The ECIB program provides a prime example of excellent cooperation among the two strongest international actors in the TVET sector in Palestine: Enabel and GIZ. With the Joint Management Structure, coordination of activities and providing matching inputs, a strong synergy was obtained. Beneficiaries, partners and both organisations benefitted from this arrangement. If on the activity level the synergy depended nearly exclusively on the willingness of the intervention teams to work together, on the financial and administrative level, procedures made it virtually impossible to share financial means for joint implementation. Here lies an important task for the Head Quarters of different donors and agencies to harmonise procedures to facilitate synergies.
Capacity building	Capacity building activities should be initiated and implemented as early as possible in the intervention. There is a need for a comprehensive capacity needs assessment on all levels based on organisational and institutional assessments. The intervention should ensure that the activities follow a planned and logical order, in particular if they are dependent on the finalisation of the previous set of activities. Tied monitoring and evaluation of the capacity building activities must assure quality and relevance.
Synergies with other Enabel interventions	Synergies between different interventions of Enabel will contribute to increasing the quality and relevance of the work of the agency in a country. It will allow for cross fertilisation, increased impact and economies of scale. In reality, synergy is severely hampered by the setup and management of interventions. The design, implementation and evaluation of interventions adopt still far too often a narrow silo thinking in which responsibilities and results are still tied to individual

	<p>interventions. Synergies are in such a setting not rewarded and even discouraged.</p> <p>The new country portfolio approach could change this reality but provides by itself insufficient guarantee that this will be the case. New approaches and procedures have to be developed to foster better synergies between interventions.</p>
<b>Lessons learned from TVET/WBL issues in Palestine</b>	
Cooperation at different governance levels	<p>The success of the intervention was largely due to an effective and action-oriented coordination and partnership on all governance levels, on the central national level (Ministries, Chambers, Unions and Federations) and the local-regional level (Governorates, TVET institutes and private sector partners) between the different TVET stakeholders. Especially in the case of work-based Learning collaboration between public (both the MoL and the MoEHE) and private partners (Chambers, Federations, Unions, NGOs, etc.) is crucial and this at all levels.</p> <p>Because of this, ECIB encouraged full coordination in the preparation of the proposals, negotiation with Enabel and implementation and evaluation of activities, which resulted in increased trust and familiarity between the different public and private partners.</p> <p>In addition to this, Enabel, together with other donors and the Ministries, supported the activation of the Higher Council for TVET, the Executive Council and the Development Center, which bring together representatives of the Ministries and private sector on a national level. It was also recommended by the <i>ETR</i> to involve the LET councils and to rewrite their mandate to ensure their responsibilities and stable financing.</p>
Clear Structures for Sustainability	<p>For WBL and CVET to continue in the future, it is essential to have a sustainable structure on the national level, with a clear strategy, legal framework and funding mechanism. The establishment of such a structure is crucial for the sustainability of the WBL provision, especially in governmental TVET institutes, which need a basis of government funding to sustain training costs as well as other sources of finance.</p> <p>The structure and framework will also have an impact on the quality of the WBL provision, especially with regards to the coverage of transportation costs and insurance, but also of general quality assurance and certification. For all these reasons, ECIB has heavily invested in the development of such a WBL strategy, legislation and manual in close collaboration with the stakeholders.</p>
Private sector in the driving seat	<p>It has proven to be essential that the private sector is closely and intensely involved in the design, roll-out and evaluation of WBL on every level. To effectively improve the labor market opportunities of graduates, it is crucial that skills offered by the TVET institutes are adapted to the skills demanded by the labor market. While it was obligatory according to ECIB regulations to involve the private sector in the application for funding of WBL initiatives, in the future, it would be recommended that the demand for new skills and courses comes directly from the private sector. Not only would this be important for the development of courses adapted to the changing labor market</p>

	demands, but it would also increase awareness of WBL in the private sector. Additionally, it is recommended to offer more support and supervision from Enabel directly to the private sector, without going through the TVET institutes first, in order to make a clear connection with the intervention, improve M&E and successfully empower the private sector partners.
Inclusive strategies	It is essential that a sustainable strategy is created regarding the inclusion of disadvantaged trainees, both on a national level as on the level of the TVET institutes. For trainees from a disadvantaged location or socio-economic background, their inclusion largely depends on the organisation of a funding mechanism, which can aid these trainees with covering tuition fees, transportation costs and insurance. Regarding other types of disadvantaged trainees, such as disabled trainees or female trainees, it is also extremely important that awareness is created on the national level as well as on the level of the TVET institutes to create a greater sensitivity to the needs of these trainees and adapt the accessibility of certain TVET training courses accordingly.
Tracer Study	<p>It has proven to be extremely difficult to organise tracer studies. Based on information provided by ETF, this is a common problem and certainly not limited to Palestine.</p> <p>In 2017-18, ECIB collaborated in three different tracings of WBL graduates to assess their employment situation. Each of these tracings operated different methodologies and definitions of employment and as a consequence, each had significantly different results.</p> <p>Tracer study results differed according to:</p> <p><i>Definition of employment:</i> Palestine is a largely informal economy, with often short-term and seasonal jobs. Current definitions of employment within the range of employed or self-employed do not cover the different gradients of employment existing in Palestine. A better method would be to ask about the number of hours of paid employment per week/month</p> <p><i>Methodology:</i> Results could differ significantly according to the method of acquiring the data, with face-to-face interviews providing the most reliable data, followed by phone calls and Facebook. Survey links sent through e-mail or sms were the least reliable</p> <p><i>Interpretation of graduates:</i> Graduates sometimes hide their employment situation because: 1) They work in Israel or in a settlement; 2) They assume Enabel is offering them a job; 3) They misunderstand the concept of employment, as mentioned above</p> <p><i>Graduate reach:</i> Graduates could sometimes not be reached because: 1) Palestinian youth have a habit of often changing phone numbers, with graduates becoming unreachable within months of graduation. It should be investigated if this correlates with their employment situation; 2) Female graduates can often only be reached through family members; and 3) Graduates take Israeli phone numbers</p> <p><i>Gender:</i> Women in Palestine have a particularly complicated employment situation, often combining housework with</p>

	microbusinesses at home or occasional or seasonal work, which should be captured better in the concept of employment in Palestine
Gender	<p>ECIB made substantial efforts in making WBL and CVET as gender-inclusive as possible, while being sensitive to the culture, as well as the needs of the labor market and the TVET institutes in Palestine. By encouraging gender sensitivity in the WBL and CVET Funding Guidelines and by operating gendered M&amp;E indicators, ECIB ensured female participation on all levels of the intervention. Moreover, several of the WBL and especially the CVET initiatives were able to introduce innovative courses, which were accessible to both men and women and offered labor market opportunities for both.</p> <p>The following lessons learned can be mentioned<sup>40</sup>:</p> <p>Gender balance: Attention for the gender balance should be included as an essential component of an intervention</p> <p>Gender sensitivity: Gender sensitivity should also be applied at all levels of the M&amp;E framework of an intervention, including guidelines, manuals, indicators and measurement tools</p> <p>Female-inclusive vocations: Forcing either men or women in traditionally male or female dominated vocations has more often than not resulted in discomfort and dropouts and does not seem to increase the employability of these graduates, regardless of labor market demand. In this sense, a careful evaluation should be made of the choice of vocations that can be supported for men and women, with an eye on labor market demand</p> <p>Family: One of the main obstacles for female participation in WBL was the resistance of their family who did not always allow them to follow training in the private sector for reasons mainly involving security and culture. Some TVET institutes were able to overcome these problems by organizing meetings with the family or community and sometimes by actively encouraging their participation or supervision in the labor market exchange</p> <p>Employment: unemployment rates among women are extremely high in Palestine because of a multitude of political, economic and social reasons, with many becoming housewives despite high levels of education. However, research showed that entrepreneurship, cooperatives and MSME's offer promising avenues of employment for women in Palestine, especially because these provide the opportunity to organize occupational work that can be performed at home.</p>

## 4.2 Recommendations

The Mid-Term and End-Term Review formulate respectively 46 and 31 recommendations directed at the different stakeholders of the program: Ministries, Private Sector, Enabel Palestine, Enabel HQ and the intervention. We enumerated here only the most important recommendations that are directly relevant for future country and sector strategies, interventions as well as more general management of Enabel. Other recommendations more directed to the partners can be found in the End-Term Review.

<sup>40</sup> Mostinckx, L. *Analysis of Gender in ECIB Program*.

Recommendation	Source	Target audience
<p><b>1. Acquire better insight in local context</b></p> <p>Quality TVET is considerably more expensive than general education and surpasses in most cases the financing capacities of governments. Additional sources of funding are in most cases required. Ideally these funds should be provided by the private sector that benefits most from high-quality TVET. However, the private sector is in general reluctant to pay for this and levy-grant systems as we know in developed countries will not necessary work in development countries.</p> <p>Prior to the launch of a new intervention in the field of TVET or Skills Development, research should take place on the willingness of the private sector and the donor community to invest in TVET/SD and a specific strategy and roadmap should be developed for financing of skills development.</p>	<p>End-Term Review Backstopping reports Formulation of New Country Portfolio</p>	<p>Sector experts Education, Training and Employment; Trade for Development Center and PSD</p>
<p><b>2. Actively involve private sector</b></p> <p>TVET and even more WBL requires the active involvement of the private sector. In an initial stage it is not evident to convince the private sector to invest in skills development. It is therefore necessary to provide financial incentives for the private sector including minor investments in material, equipment, rehabilitation, etc.</p> <p>The current grant agreement regulations of Enabel is too restrictive and should be broadened to allow for this kind of limited support.</p>	<p>End-Term Review Backstopping reports Formulation of New Country Portfolio</p>	<p>Finance and Operations directorates and Sector Experts Education, Training and Employment; Trade for Development Center and PSD</p>
<p><b>3. Broaden the scope from WBL to private sector development</b></p> <p>WBL brought the public and private sector together around the shared objectives of improving the skills and competences of the TVET graduates and to facilitate the transition from school to work. The private sector, however, encounters itself great difficulties in keeping up with the technological evolution due to a limited access to specialised training. A holistic approach widening the spectrum of TVET to include private sector development could tackle these different problems simultaneously.</p> <p>The logical next step is therefore to transform the current WBL fund into private sector led sectoral training funds offering several advantages:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The private sector takes the lead (albeit public sector representatives are part of the structure) and can hence define its own priorities and can seek the best partners to reach its objectives</li> <li>• By starting from a small number of sectoral funds the situation remains more manageable and can</li> </ul>	<p>End-Term Review Backstopping reports Formulation of New Country Portfolio</p>	<p>Sector Experts Education, Training and Employment; Trade for Development Center and PSD</p>

<p>produce quick wins in a short time without too much administrative burden</p> <p>The following components can be part of a next intervention:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The further development of the institutional and legal framework for the TVET-LM subsector allowing e.g. TVET institutes to operate in a PPP setting and acquiring greater autonomy, which is at the moment as good as inexistent in public TVET institutes</li> <li>2. Launch pilot sector training funds focussing on the most promising sectors in terms of growth, employment potential and readiness to opt for this financing mechanism. In an initial phase a pooled donor fund or another external financing mechanism will support the start-up costs of these funds. In a later phase these funds will be run autonomously</li> <li>3. Extending initial TVET training to Continuous Vocational Education and Training (CVET) offering skills upscaling and upgrading for private sector employers, employees and jobseekers including lifelong learning schemes to increase the competitiveness of the Palestinian private sector</li> <li>4. Create hubs for local economic development by creating synergies between public (local governance structures, ministries, etc.) and private sector organisations (federations, Chambers, etc.) and develop joint initiatives</li> <li>5. Promote entrepreneurship and self-employment among TVET graduates by integrating entrepreneurship training in skills development and offer business development support to employers and starters.</li> </ol>		
--	--	--

## PART 2: Synthesis of (operational) monitoring

### 1 Follow-up of decisions by the JLCB

#	Decision	Period	Actions	Resp.	Progress	Status
1	Creation of a new position of National Program Coordinator within the PMT	Q3 2013	Adapt ToR for PMT members and send job description to JLCB for approval	Enabel	Recruitment process completed	Closed
2	Revision of the title of National Technical Assistant (NTA), leaving out "Expert in Capacity Development Cooperation"	Q3 2013	BTC to adapt ToR for PMT members and send out job description for approval and publication	Enabel	Recruitment process completed	Closed
3	Agreement on a cost sharing of positions of International Sector Expert and Administrative and Financial Officer	Q4 2013	Extend contracts of ISE and AFO	Enabel	Recruitment process completed	Closed
4	Participation in JLCB open to a representative of the social Partners	Q1 2014	Revision of composition JLCB	JLCB	Social Partners are active members of the JLCB	Closed
5	Hosting of the PMT within the MoEHE at least the 1st year of the program	Q1 2014	MoEHE to allocate office space for the PMT as soon as possible	MoEHE	PMT office temporarily hosted at the Enabel Offices in Ramallah, until MoEHE has increased office space expected by end of 2014	Closed
6	Intervention to be equipped with local antennas/field coordinators to assure implementation in the districts	Q2 2014	Identify potential liaison officers at the district level accountable for follow up on the activities within local structures	PMT	Agreement with Federation of CCI's to host local antennas and national WBL advisor	Closed
7	Exchange letters to authorize the PMT members for utilizing the car (PMT/Enabel/MoEHE/MoL)	Q3 2014	Exchange of letters on subject	PMT	car received in Jan 2015 and formal exemption for utilisation of intervention car from transportation department in MoT	Closed
8	The organisational set-up of the intervention needs to be discussed to ensure efficient implementation of intervention and guarantee ownership	Q1 2015	Organize follow up meetings reviewing, clarifying and modifying (if necessary) the organisational set up of the inter-vention, identifying representatives of the different units of the ministries of MoEHE and MoL for intervention follow up	PMT	Meeting with Ministry officials decided to opt for joint steering of TVET interventions (Enabel and GIZ) through Joint Management Team and joint thematic units	Closed
9	Endorsement of the ECIB results report 2014	Q1 2015	PMT presents results report to JLCB	PMT	JLCB endorsed report including change of Management Structure	Closed



10	Endorsement of the selection process and selection of 10 WBL pilot initiatives	Q2 2015	Provide report on the initial impact of the first round of WBL before 06/2015	PMT	Pilot successfully launched, and evaluation report published	Closed
	Endorsement of the 2015 Action Plan and financial planning	Q2 2015	Revise the 2015 planning with actions identified by inception study	PMT	Activities planned and executed according to Plan	Closed
11	Endorsement of new steering modality of the intervention delegating strategic and technical discussion to the new Joint Management team for TVET. JLCB responsible for legal and financial issues	Q2 2015	initiate the first Joint Management team for TVET meeting (MOEHE, MOL, Enabel and GIZ)	PMT	Meeting took place as foreseen and Joint Management Team (JMT) for TVET is operational	Closed
12	Endorsement of the Inception Study Report	Q2 2015	Endorsement of final report by JLCB	JLCB	Recommendations of inception study report are incorporated in the work packages (WPs)	Closed
13	Endorsement of initial list of work packages	Q3 2015	Work out in detail the work packages with GIZ and technical committees (PMT) & add communication and M&E to the list of Work Packages	TVET JSC	joint implementation of the WP by the thematic working groups. WPs annexed to the TFF	Closed
14	73 WBL initiatives approved including scholarship fund for total of 1,8 M €	Q4 2015	Evaluation of the received WBL initiatives by a mixed committee of MoL, MoEHE and Social Partners	TVET JSC	73 grants agreements signed, and information sessions organised for TVET institutes and private sector partners	Closed
15	Opening of new office in Gaza	Q4 2015	Open position and recruit Gaza Field Officer. Look for safe location for office	PMT	Gaza Field Office is operational and Haneen Abu Nahla has been appointed as Gaza Field Officer	Closed
16	Operationalisation of Thematic Working Groups	Q1 2016	Organize a workshop in Jericho for all thematic working groups Organise regular meeting of the TWGs	TVET JSC	Workshop has been organised and 5+1 TWGs have been officially established	Closed
17	Endorsement of the 2015 Results Report	Q1 2016	PMT presents results report to JLCB	PMT	JLCB endorsed report	
18	Endorsement of the adapted monitoring matrix of the intervention	Q1 2016	PMT presented the modified monitoring matrix to the JLCB	PMT	JLCB approved the adapted monitoring matrix	Closed
19	Approval of the 2016 Financial Budget and all budget modifications	Q4 2016	PMT presents Financial Budget and all budget modifications to JLCB	PMT	Implementation of budget modification by PMT	Closed
20	Approval of the 2017 Action Plan, financial planning and budget modification	Q1 2017	PMT presents Action Plan, financial planning and all budget modifications to JLCB	PMT	Implementation of action plan as approved by JLCB	Closed
21	Approval of the launch of a call for proposal for the Continuous Vocational Education and Training fund (CVET) and selection of 30 initiatives for 171,500 €	Q2 2017	PMT presented the concept of the call for proposal for the CVET to JLCB. PMT presents list of selected initiatives for the CVET Fund by a jury consisting of	PMT	JLCB approved concept of the call for proposal for the CVET JLCB approved list of selected initiatives for the CVET Fund	Closed

			representatives from both ministries and the private sector		Grant agreements signed for each initiative	
22	Approval of the intervention closure planning	Q1 2018	PMT presents intervention closure planning Action to JLCB	PMT	PMT followed up closure of intervention as planned	Closed
23	Approval of WBL TWG as a national committee to draft a national WBL strategy, legislation and operational manual	Q1 2018	SC approved the Technical working group from the WBL TWG as a national committee	PMT	National WBL strategy, WBL legislation and WBL operational manual finalised	Closed
24	Approval of end of intervention balance by JLCB	Q2 2018	PMT presents financial status of intervention and end of intervention balance to JLCB	PMT	PMT followed up closure of intervention as planned	Closed
25	Approval of WBL Strategy and WBL Legislation by JLCB and will be taken to the next Higher Council meeting for further endorsement	Q2 2018	PMT presents national WBL strategy, WBL legislation and WBL operational manual to JLCB	PMT	National WBL strategy, legislation and operational manual approved by JMT for TVET and the Higher Council for TVET	Closed

## 2 Expenses

See [annex 1](#). Export an overview of expenses from FIT

## 3 Disbursement rate of the intervention

Source of financing	Cumulated budget	Real expenses cumulated	Cumulated disbursement rate	Comments and remarks
Direct Belgian Contribution	5,000,000	4,968,790	99%	
Contribution of the Partner Country	148,000	148,000	100%	
Other source				

## 4 Personnel of the intervention

Personnel (title and name)	Gender (M/F)	Duration of recruitment (start and end dates)
National personnel put at disposal by the Partner Country: None		
Support personnel, locally recruited by Enabel:		
1. Naser Ghanim, National Project Coordinator	M	01/01/2014 - 30/06/2018
2. Maram Saeed, National Technical Assistant	F	02/01/2014 - 30/04/2018
3. Haneen Abu Nahla, Gaza Field Officer	F	01/12/2015 - 15/07/2018
4. Hanan Wahhab, Financial and Administrative Officer	F	02/01/2014 - 15/07/2018
5. Rami Awad, Financial Assistant	M	07/11/2016 - 30/04/2018
6. Haneen Nazzal, Administrative Assistant	F	26/04/2015 - 30/04/2018
7. Mohamed Naser, Driver	M	01/02/2014 - 30/06/2016
Training personnel, locally recruited: None		

International Personnel (outside Enabel): None		
International experts (Enabel):		
1. Thierry Foubert, International Technical Advisor	M	02/01/2014 - 30/06/2015
2. Bart Horemans, International Technical Advisor	M	16/06/2015 - 30/06/2018
3. Alexandra Verniers, Junior M&E expert	F	06/03/2016 - 05/03/2017
4. Laure Mostinckx, Junior M&E expert	F	13/03/2017 - 17/07/2018

## 5 Public procurement

Please see [annex 2](#).

## 6 Public agreements

Please see [annex 3](#).

## 7 Equipment

List equipment acquired during the intervention

Equipment type	Cost		delivery date		Remarks
	budget	real	budget	real	Decision of JLCB
Project Car		27,903		22/03/2015	Handed over to the MOEHE at the end of the intervention
Laptop, docking station, screen #3		3,313		05/03/2014	Will remain in office for future interventions
Network Installation		1,684		10/11/2014	Will remain in office for future interventions
Laptop, Printer – Gaza Office		2,966		14/03/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions
Laptop – Gaza Office		904		30/08/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions
Server Cabinet & Installation		1,646		18/09/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions
Digital Camera		387		08/11/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions
Laptops & accessories #2 – Finance		2,434		18/12/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions
Printer		440		12/11/2017	Will remain in office for future interventions
Office Furniture		2,867		10/04/2014	Will remain in office for future interventions
Office Furniture – Gaza Office		1,512		14/03/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions
Office desk & chair - Gaza		598		05/12/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions
Office Desk		260		06/12/2016	Will remain in office for future interventions

Digital Camera – Gaza Office		412		09/03/2017	Will remain in office for future interventions
AC & Water Cooler Machine - Gaza		473		06/08/2017	Will remain in office for future interventions

## 8 Original Logical Framework from TFF

	Logical of the intervention	Indicators	Sources of verification	Hypotheses
<b>GO</b>	<b>Global objective</b> Contribution is brought go State Building through enhancing the Palestinian capacities in view of institutional development			Political stability
<b>SO</b>	<b>Specific objective</b> The institutional capacities of the beneficiary institutes involved in the apprenticeships scheme and scholarships are improved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increased number of graduates in TVET</li> <li>Increased number of graduates of apprenticeships</li> <li>Increased numbers of internships</li> <li>Increased employment rates of apprentices and interns</li> <li>Active engagement of MoE, MoHE, MoL and Private Sector Organisations in the dialogue on TVET</li> <li>Increased number of graduates from disadvantaged families</li> <li>Increased number of female graduates in TVET, apprenticeships and internships</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>M&amp;E systems of the concerned Ministries</li> <li>Press releases</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The priorities of the current TVET strategy are being maintained</li> <li>Active collaboration of all Stakeholders (MoE, MoHE, MoL, Private Sectors Organisations) at central and local level</li> <li>Staff members of MoE, MoHE, MoL and Social Private Organisations, designated to the program will have sufficient time available for implementing the activities</li> <li>Private Sector companies and training providers engage themselves in Apprenticeship</li> <li>A manageable number of stakeholders involved in the program</li> <li>Good coordination and collaboration between the intervention, ministries staff and other donors, involved in the TVET sector</li> </ul>



<b>R1</b>	<b>Result 1:</b> Ministry Staff and Private Sector Organisations, involved in technical and vocational skills development facilitate and supervise the implementation of apprenticeship models within the apprenticeship scheme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Official validated (by MoE, MoHE and MoL) national apprenticeships scheme, models and tools</li> <li>• Approved (by MoE, MoHE, MoL and Social Private Organisations) apprenticeships strategy at national level, including the development of at least one trade related to green economy and the promotion of TVET by females</li> <li>• Approved (by MoE, MoHE, MoL and Social Private Organisations) capacity building strategy regarding apprenticeships for central and decentralised levels for staff of MoE, MoHE, MoL, Private Sector Organisations and action plan for implementation</li> <li>• Information campaign to promote apprenticeships and enrolment of females in TVET</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ministry statements in the Media</li> <li>• Minutes of meetings of the Palestinian Authority</li> <li>• Minutes of meetings of MoE, MoHE, MoL, Private Sector Organisations, Higher Council for TVET and the TVET Executive Board</li> <li>• Private Sector Organisations' press declarations and reports</li> <li>• Program reports</li> <li>• Press Releases</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ministry staff and Private Sector Organisation staff communicate regularly and accept each other's roles and involvement</li> <li>• The partners fine-tune their interpretation on the key elements of Apprenticeship.</li> <li>• They inform each other on on-going initiatives</li> </ul>
<b>R2</b>	<b>Result 2:</b> The partners at local level implement apprenticeships	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Apprenticeships models for selected trades implemented in the 19 Vocational Schools/ Vocational Training Centres</li> <li>• Implementation strategies for apprenticeships, including developed tools for each Vocational School/Vocational Training Centre</li> <li>• Approved (by MoE, MoHE, MoL, Social Private Organisations) Capacity Building Strategy for apprenticeships for each Vocational School/Vocational Training Centre, with specific attention to environmental behaviour in trainings</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reports of meetings of Vocational Training Centres, MoL, Private Sector Organisations</li> <li>• MoE, MoHE, MoL and Private Sector Organisations' press declarations and reports</li> <li>• Reports of training events, call for proposals, manual of apprenticeship fund</li> <li>• Reports of the Capacity Building Program</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Smooth collaborative links at the local level.</li> <li>• A trouble-shooting mechanism exists in each locality</li> <li>• The program management team has good communicative capacities.</li> <li>• A sufficient number of companies do engage in apprenticeship and take their responsibility seriously</li> </ul>
<b>R3</b>	<b>Result 3:</b> Economically and socially disadvantaged learners have access to training and coaching	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Developed pro-poor and pro-gender strategies of scholarships</li> <li>• Study on effectiveness of scholarships</li> <li>• Approved follow-up system in place</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reports of MoE, MoHE</li> <li>• Program records</li> <li>• Tracer study</li> </ul>	Scholarship holders keep contact with BTC and their educational institution

## 9 Complete Monitoring Matrix

#	Results / Indicators	Indicator definition	Disaggregation	Baseline Value	End of project target	Annual target values				Unit of measurement	Source of verification	Frequency of data collection	Start - end measurements	Responsible data collection	Responsible consolidation	Source of Base line data
						Y1	Y2	Y3	Y4							
IMPACT: Contribution is brought to State Building through enhancing the Palestinian capacities in view of institutional development																
1	Percentage of youth with TVET qualification (PCBS data)	Percentage of youth with TVET qualification from the overall youth (aged 15-29) in Palestine calculated as the sum of those finished technical education (TE), Vocational education (VE) and Vocational training (VT)	Overall	Overall: 23.3%	At least 5% increase	NA	1%	3%	5%	Percentage	PCBS-annual Labour Force survey	Annually	31 <sup>st</sup> May- 15 <sup>th</sup> Aug of each year	PCBS	Project M&E staff in coordination with PCBS and TVET Monitoring Unit	PCBS-annual Labour Force survey, 2013
			Gender	M: 26.6% F: 18.3%												
			Location of institution	WB: 20.6% Gaza: 23.1%												
			Qualification level	4:TE: 13.9% 3:VE: 1.7%												
				2: VT: 7.7%												
2	Sustainable nationally recognised body is facilitating and monitoring WBL for all systems at national level	A national body of TVET policy makers and PS representatives that is capacitated and resourced with laws and regulations and given the mandate is operating efficiently to facilitate and monitor WBL Y2: Prepared the ground through M&E committee, 20% Y3: informal intermediate structure is in place: 60% Y4: The Body is endorsed formally, effective and sustainable:100%	N/A	NO	YES (100%)	0 %	20%	60%	100 %	Yes/No	National Mandate, endorsed laws, strategies and regulations	Annually	Start, middle, and end of project	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	Base Line Study

OUTCOME: The institutional capacities of the beneficiary institutions involved in the apprenticeships scheme and in scholarships are improved																
1	Number of WBL graduates, who conduct more than 30% structured field training in the work place	Total number of youth within the TVET system successfully completed WBL with more than 30% structured field training in the work place and have systemised relation with companies/PS clear plan and follow-up in the set year (Apprenticeship)	Overall	329	2000	Y1	Y2	Y3	Y4	Integer	Developed M&E system and data collection from institutions if available	Annually	31st Oct- 15th Dec of each year	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	TVET survey & collected data
Gender	M: 254	1544	Location of institution	F: 75	456		309	1081	1544							
	WB: 329 including East Jerusalem	1500		91	319		456									
	Gaza: 0	500		100	350		500									
2	Percentage of WBL graduates who complete transition to employment or self-employment	The percentage of WBL graduate who are employed or self-employed aged 15-29 (Youth) compared to TVET graduates, by level	TVET graduates rate by	TE graduates: 49.1%	63%		NA	58%	63%	Percentage	Conducting 2 Tracer studies	Twice in Q4 Y3 and Q3 Y4	31st May- 15th Aug of each year	Project through consultant	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Mapping, Case study and internal data of
	VE graduates: 66.9%	86%		NA	79%	86%										
	VT graduates: 68.5%	88%		NA	81%	88%										
3	TVET providers and Social Partners / PS representative are jointly engaged in monitoring WBL and developed policies	The indicator measures joint systemised interaction leading to achieving the impact measured through number of meetings conducted at three levels for WBL (Macro, Meso and Micro)	Macro: National level	0	3 per year at national level	0	3	3	3	Integer	Meeting Minutes	Annually	31 <sup>st</sup> Oct- 15 <sup>th</sup> Dec of each year	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET monitoring unit for Macro and focal points at regional level for Meso and principle for micro	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET monitoring unit	Base line study
	Meso: Governorate level	0	1-4 per year per governo rate	0	1	2	4									
	Micro: institute level	0	1-4 per year per institute	0	1	2	4									

**Result I: At the national level relevant policy makers, private sector organisations and other social partners are capacitated and working together to facilitate and supervise the implementation of different work-based learning schemes**

						Y1	Y2	Y3	Y4							
1	A WBL strategy at the national level that provides for different WBL schemes and is approved by relevant authorities with policies and regulations	WBL strategy on the national level that includes capacity building for all stakeholders is approved with all relevant partners' agreement, policies and regulations: - at Year 2 Initiation of discussions among stake-holders regarding strategy, context analysis and identification of strategic options in coordination with all stakeholders:20% progress. - at Year 3 first half: Drafting of strategy and circulation among stakeholders: 50% progress. - At Year 3: Second half: Approval of strategy and producing final version with action plan, policies and regulations (70%) - at Year 4 Adopting approved strategy by relevant ministries and other stakeholders and Implementation of strategy in accordance with action plan:100 progress (completed)	N/A	No	Yes (100%)		20%	70%	100% (YES)	Yes/No	Copies of approved WBL and documentation of relevant stakeholders approval of the strategy at Y4, Minutes, and Y3 final strategy	Annually	Start, middle, and end of project	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	
2	Laws and regulations are amended to enable WBL implementation	Laws and regulations are amended to enable WBL implementation in line with findings of the study: -Y2 Initiation of discussions among all relevant stakeholders regarding relevant laws and regulations, legal study of the law, and redrafting the relevant laws, discussion and approval of stakeholders: 30%. - Y3 Advocacy actions are taken, and Formal communication is made to amend relevant laws and regulations: 60% progress - Y4 Modification to relevant laws and regulations is approved and Modified laws and regulations are formally adopted to enable WBL implementation: 100%.	N/A	No	Yes (100%)		30%	60%	100% (YES)	Yes/No	Copies of amended laws and regulations at Y4; Y2: minutes, Y3 actions and communications	Annually	Start, middle, and end of project	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	

3	Number of policy level staff at central and decentralized level and social partners employees that are capacitated to facilitate and <b>supervise</b> WBL as a result of the project	Number of policy level staff who now have the needed skills and knowledge <u>to facilitate and supervise WBL at all levels</u> . Skills and knowledge must correspond to those in the capacity building needs assessment survey/study. Measurement are based on pre and post self-assessment and trainer assessment based on clear indicators of measure in accordance with the study.	Overall	0	100		20	50	100		Copies of end-of-capacity building program certificates and training attendance sheets. Pre and post survey	Annually	Start, middle, and end of project	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with the TVET Monitoring Unit	Baseline study
			Gender		At least 30% are females		6	15	30							
			Location		20% Gaza		4	10	20							
			Type of institute : TVET/P S institute		70 policy level staff		14	35	70							
					30 social partners		6	15	30							
4	Pro-marginalised strategy and policies of scholarships are developed	Pro-marginalised national strategy and relevant policies for scholarships that considers gender, disability, location, and poverty level aspects are developed. -Y2: Initiation of discussions among all relevant stakeholders regarding strategy, Context analysis and Identification of strategic options in coordination with all relevant stakeholders: 20% progress. -Y3: Drafting of strategy, circulation among relevant stakeholders, approval of strategy and producing final version with an action plan and policies 70% progress. - Y4 Adopting approved strategy and policies by relevant ministries and stakeholders and Implementation of strategy in accordance with action plan and policies: 100 progress (completed).	N/A	No	Yes		20%	70%	100% (Yes)	Yes/No	Copies of developed pro-marginalised scholarship strategies	Annually	Start, middle, and end of project	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	

#### Result II: At the local level, relevant stakeholders are capacitated and are implementing work-based learning

						Y1	Y2	Y3	Y4							
1	Number of TVET institutes that are	Total number of TVET institutes implementing WBL with at least systematised 30% training in the	Overall	Overall: 4	50 Institutes out of 72		12	30	50	Integer	Developed M&E system	Annually	31 May- 15 Sept of	Project M&E staff	Project M&E staff	Institutes Survey

	implementing formal and structural WBL	market place and have official structured relation with companies/PS through MOU &/or Contracts and through using WBL tools (formats, guidelines, logbooks)	Location (TVET institute)	WB: 4	WB: 40 out of 54		10	23	40							
				Gaza: 0	Gaza: 10 out of 18		2	7	10							
			Type of TVET institute	Colleges: 0	12		2	6	12							
				VSS: 2	16		5	8	16							
				VTCs: 2	22		5	11	22							
2	Numbers of TVET Institutes that have Staff/teachers/trainers and Companies that have mentors capacitated to implement WBL	Total number of TVET Institutes and Companies that have admin and follow-up staff, teachers and trainers and Mentors (companies) who were capitated and have the needed skills and knowledge to implement WBL	By type of institutes that have staff /mentor capacitated (institutes)	Institutes with capaci- tated staff for WBL: 4	Targeted TVET institutes: 58		12	35	58	Integer	Developed M&E system and data collection from institutes, and PM and regional hubs data files	Annually	31 May- 15 <sup>th</sup> Sept of each year	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Institutions Survey and Case Study
				Companie s that have capacitate d mentors: NA	At Least 160 Average of 10 from each governorat e		At least 64	At least 128	At least 160							
			By Location (TVET staff/ Company mentors)	West Bank: 4 institutes trained staff	3 staff members trained per institute: WB: 139/ G: 35/ T:174		- Av. 4 from each govern orate	-Av. 8 from each gove rnorate	-Av. 10 from each governo rate							
				Gaza: 0 institutes trained staff			7	21	35	Integer						
				NA	1 mentor per		51	102	128							



					company. At least 20% companies from Gaza		13	26	32							
			By Gender (TVET staff/ Company mentors)	Gender of TVET staff - M: NA	At least 35% females for 3 trained per institute, 226 M/122F		23	68	113							
				Gender of TVET staff - F: NA			13	37	61							
				Gender of mentors M: NA	At least 25% of trained mentors are females		48	96	120							
				Gender of mentors F: NA			16	32	40							
3	Number of TVET institutes that adopt documented regulations and policies that are pro-poor, pro-marginalised and gender sensitive	Number of institutes implementing WBL that formally adopt regulations and policies that are pro-poor, marginalised and/or gender sensitive regulations and procedures	Type of TVET institute and locality	WB: College: o	At least 80% of TVET institutes					Integer	Developed M&E system and data collection from institutions	Annually	31 <sup>st</sup> May- 15 <sup>th</sup> Sept of each year	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Institutions Survey and Case Study
				WB: VSS: 1												
				WB: VTC: 2												
				Gaza: College: o												
				Gaza: VSS: o												
				Gaza: VTC: o												

		Number of institutes that formally adopt regulations and policies that are pro-poor, marginalised and/or gender sensitive by type of policy	Type of regulation/ policy area (i.e. pro-poor, pro-marginalised, and gender sensitive)	See table below	Double the amount		NA	NA	Double the amount	Integer	End of project study including WB and Gaza	Once end of project	6 months before project ends	Project through consultant	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET	Institutions Survey
--	--	---	---	-----------------	-------------------	--	----	----	-------------------	---------	--	---------------------	------------------------------	----------------------------	---	---------------------

### Result III: Economically and socially disadvantaged youth have improved access to training and coaching

1	Number of recipients of scholarships	Total number of scholarship recipients of disadvantaged youth to enable them access to training and coaching, disaggregated by gender, location, poverty level, and type of marginalisation	Overall	0	-At least 2000	400	1400	2000	Integer	Scholarship award letters given to all recipients from all institutions	Annually	Start, middle, and end of project	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	
			Gender		at least 23% are Female	91	319	456							
			Location		at least 25% from Gaza	100	350	500							
			Poverty level		at least 50% are from (extremely) poor families	200	700	1000							
			Type of marginalisation		at least 25% for locality	100	350	500							
					10% difficult social cond.	40	140	200							
					10% PWD	40	140	200							

2	Approved follow-up and monitoring scheme for scholarship is implemented	<p>A clear and specific follow-up and monitoring scheme at national level that oversees and measures progress made in the scholarship scheme at individual level.</p> <p>Y2: Initiation of discussions among all relevant stakeholders regarding scheme, and Drafting of scheme and circulation among relevant stakeholders:20% progress</p> <p>-Y3 Approval of scheme and producing final version with an action plan 70% progress</p> <p>-Y4 Adopting approved scheme by relevant stakeholders, and Implementation of scheme in their institutes in accordance with action plan:100% progress (completed)</p>	N/A	No	Yes		20%	70%	100% (YES)	Yes/No	Documentation of approval and data collected for corresponding indicators	Annually	Start, middle, and end of project	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	Project M&E staff in coordination with TVET Monitoring Unit	
---	---	---	-----	----	-----	--	-----	-----	------------	--------	---	----------	-----------------------------------	---	---	--

## 10 Tools and products

### 1. Publications

#### Manuals and methodologies:

- Work-based Learning Craftsperson's Manual (2017) (Arabic)
- Work-based Learning Trainees' Manual (2017) (Arabic)
- CVET Manual (2017) (English/Arabic)
- Work-based Learning Manual (2018) (English/Arabic)

#### Scientific Publications:

- *Technical Education and Vocational Training in the Gaza Strip, Between Present and Future.* Report of the first scientific TVET conference in Gaza (2016)
- Horemans, B. & Hilal, R. (2017). *Closing the Gap: The Introduction of Work-based Learning Schemes in Palestine.* In: TVET@Asia, issue 9, 1-14. Online: [http://www.tvet-online.asia/issue9/Horemans\\_Hilal\\_tvet9.pdf](http://www.tvet-online.asia/issue9/Horemans_Hilal_tvet9.pdf)

#### Studies:

- WBL Inception Study (2015)
- Qualitative Research on Recruitment Processes of TVET Graduates in Palestine (2015)
- TVET Labour Market Needs Assessment Study in the Gaza Strip (2016)
- Assessment of Informal Apprenticeship in Palestine (2016)

### 2. Capitalisation reports

- M&E report on ECIB WBL pilot in Palestine (2015)
- M&E report on the ECIB Vocational Evening Courses Pilot in Palestine (2017)
- Progress Report on the implementation of the ECIB WBL Fund in Palestine (2017)
- Intermediate Report for Coaching, Monitoring & Evaluation of 75 Work-based Learning Initiatives in Palestine
- Period: Feb 2016-Jan 2017 M&E report on the implementation of the ECIB WBL Fund in Palestine (2018)
- Analysis of Gender in the ECIB program (2018)
- Analysis of Environment in the ECIB program (2018)
- Final M&E report on the implementation of ECIB WBL initiatives in Palestine (2018)
- Final M&E report on the implementation of ECIB CVET initiatives in Palestine (2018)
- Tracer Study Report of ECIB WBL initiatives (2018)
- Final report for: "Coaching, Monitoring & Evaluation of 75 Work-based Learning Initiatives in Palestine." Period Feb 2016 - Jan 2018

### 3. Audio-visual material

- Booklet on success stories from the work-based learning (WBL) and continuous vocational education and training (CVET) programs (2018)
- Booklet on Private Sector Development in Palestine (2017)
- Video's on TVET week in Gaza (2016 & 2017)
- Video on success story of ECIB WBL in Gaza (2017)
- Video on ECIB WBL/CVET initiatives in Gaza (2018)
- Enabel Palestine Social Media: Facebook, Twitter
- Enabel Palestine Website
- WBL and Gender Poster (2018)
- WBL Results Poster (2018)