



**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY of the
End-term Review report of :
Enhancing Capacities for institution
building programme**

PZA 12 029 11

State of Palestine

Sergij Gabrscek, Ziad Jweiles

Transtec



Belgian development agency

enabel.be

Enabel • Belgian Development Agency • Public-law company with social purposes
Rue Haute 147 • 1000 Brussels • T. +32 (0)2 505 37 00 • enabel.be

This review has been realised in the framework of the cooperation between State of Palestine and Belgium.

The report has been drawn up by independent external experts.

The opinions expressed in this document are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of ENABEL, the Belgian Development Cooperation or the authorities of the country concerned.

Intervention Form

DGCD intervention number:	NN 3012293
Navision code ENABEL:	PZA 12 029 11
Partner institution:	Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Ministry of Labour
Duration of intervention:	60 months (project 48 months for implementation)
Duration of Specific Agreement:	July 2018
Starting date of intervention:	24 July 2013 (CMO) & 31 July 2013 (SC "0")
Partner Contribution:	EUR 148,000
Belgian Contribution:	EUR 5.000,000
Total Contribution:	EUR 5.148,000
Intervention sectors:	43081 – Multisector education/training

Intervention summary

The ECIB programme focuses on improving the qualitative and quantitative aspects of work-based learning practices at the technical and vocational education and training (TVET) programmes in Palestine. The intervention is aimed at “enhancing the capacities of youth for employment and economic development & (contributing to state building) through enhancing the institutional capacities and integrating the work place, its actors and its representatives in Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET)”. It addresses relevant policy makers, private sector organisations and other social partners at national and local level and contributing to improving access of economically and socially disadvantaged youth.

Executive Summary

*BTC listens to stakeholders (Palestinian IT Association, Gaza)
February 21, 2018*

The ECIB programme focuses on **improving the qualitative and quantitative aspects of work-based learning** practices in technical and vocational education and training (TVET) programmes in Palestine. The intervention is aimed at “enhancing the capacities of youth for employment and economic development and contributing to state building through enhancing the institutional capacities and integrating the work place, its actors and its representatives in Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET)”. In order to contribute to the tackling of the 40% youth unemployment and to address the high skills shortages and skills mismatch, the ECIB programme requires a smart positioning within the wider context of the fragile Palestinian economy.

The ECIB programme aims to achieve this through a **coordinated approach** in the TVET sub-sector and through a multilevel focus on work-based learning, providing: direct access to work-based learning for disadvantaged youth (through **scholarships**), while empowering the public and private partners to implement more TVET relevant to the labour market (through a **competitive fund**), and ensuring systemic change by enabling the necessary institutional and sustainable environment for TVET and Work-Based Learning at the national level (through **capacity building**).

Following the recommendation of the inception study and the Theory of Change workshop the revised results are:

- Result 1: At the national level relevant policy makers, private sector organizations and other social partners are capacitated and working together to facilitate and supervise the implementation of different work-based learning schemes.
- Result 2: At the local level relevant stakeholders are capacitated and are implementing work-based learning
- Result 3: Economically and socially disadvantaged youth have improved access to training and coaching

The purpose of the End-Term Review was to answer generic evaluation questions pertaining to the performance of the ECIB project. The evaluation team used the five DAC criteria, but with a special focus on efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability. In addition to answering the **generic evaluation questions**, the ETR also addressed **specific questions** regarding future intervention(s) that should be focused on supporting self-employment, developing capacities of private sector and institutionalisation of WBL in the TVET sector in Palestine.

The primary method of data collection consisted of **semi-structured interviews** with stakeholders and beneficiaries. Where possible, interviews were combined with **observations** during field visits, focus group interviews, and **study/analysis** of additional documentation that was provided during **the field mission**. The team visited a sample of TVET institutions in Hebron, Bethlehem, Ramallah, Jenin and East Jerusalem. The evaluation team was also able to visit the Gaza Strip and evaluate developments in the region, which joined the ECIB project just before the MTR.

The team's findings have subsequently been checked, and our preliminary conclusions and recommendations have been discussed towards the end of the mission. The presentation of the preliminary results to the project team and main beneficiaries was held on the last day of the mission in Ramallah. A long **discussion** during that meeting helped to clarify some of the issues. Some **written comments** were provided after the meeting and were taken into account during the preparation of the draft report.

Analysis of the project's **relevance (A)** showed that the project is still **largely relevant**, both in its objectives and in the revised results it aimed to achieve. The intervention is in line with problems, needs and priorities of the country. The ECIB programme is **most relevant in its promotion of the WBL programme**.

The project is **in tune with the priorities and development policies** of the partner government at the national and local level. The Strategic Program for Employment foresees a central role for TVET, including Work-based learning (WBL) and entrepreneurship training, as a strong instrument to combat youth unemployment and to make the labour market more efficient. There were some developments that are paving the way towards the systematisation of WBL as an integral part of TVET. The project is **consistent with the Belgian government and Enabel priorities** as it focuses on education and work-based learning.

Through its **focus on the disadvantaged youth** ECIB tackled also the problem of the high numbers of youth who are neither in employment, education or training (NEET). ECIB has been developing **non-formal education programs** that gives young people the opportunity to learn a skill in a relative short period of time (3 to 6 months) in close collaboration with the Vocational Training Centres and the private sector in Palestine. Non-formal education programmes also give an opportunity to graduates that finished university studies and are unemployed, so they can develop competences outside their basic education allowing them to get employment or being self-employed.

There is a **mismatch between the skills and competences** needed by the labour market and those developed in the formal TVET system. The ECIB programme is most relevant as by **promoting and supporting different forms of work-based learning (WBL) schemes** in Palestine it offers the chance to the students to acquire real work experience during their training. It also provided TVET institutions and private sector the opportunity to define the skills and competences that are needed and revise or develop new programmes according to the real needs of the LM and better matching those skills.

Close collaboration was established between TVET institutions and private sector organisations. TVET programmes within the initiatives were designed or revised according to the needs of the labour market better matching skills needed. Taking into account the labour market needs it provided learners the **opportunity to learn what they really need in a workplace** but also private sector with well-trained individuals with competences needed for the workplace and no needs for additional training.

Relevance is also reflected through support to transversal themes. Support has been in particular provided to the **empowerment of female students** through the institution's initiatives that encourage them to participate (nearly half of participant are female). An important aspect of this is the **provision of scholarships** that allow **women and disadvantaged** trainees to attend training.

The project **efficiency (A)** was not very high in the first year of the project. However following the inception phase with the updated log frame of the project and its indicators and the completed monitoring matrix, it increased in the second half of 2015 with a number of activities that were rolled out. The project management team was reinforced. To assure the efficient management of the program, a full-time International Technical Adviser with the necessary knowledge and experience in similar assignments was hired. An Operation and Communication Officer joined the core team in the same period (mid-2015). All these **changes favourably influenced the implementation** of the project.

A **field officer for Gaza** joined the project at the end of 2015 as requested by the Steering Committee. This was an important step in including and coordinating all activities with Gaza, which had been left behind during the first steps of project implementation. The Gaza officer has proven to be indispensable for the coordination and follow-up of the program in the Gaza Strip and resulted in **a very successful series of activities** in this part of Palestine.

The M&E framework was also developed, **relevant indicators** in line with the revised results were defined and the monitoring system put in place. The ECIB program benefited greatly from the M&E support given by the Junior Technical Assistants since the beginning of March 2016. With their contributions, ECIB now has an **efficient M&E system** that is capable of measuring the main results and key performance indicators of the program.

Based on the recommendations of the audit report of mid-2016, a financial assistant was hired to assure the efficient financial follow-up and control of the 73 WBL initiatives. For Gaza the option was taken to hire a consultant to offer additional financial and administrative support to the Gaza officer.

The revised TFF provided **a clear roadmap** to the project but there were also important changes in the project's human resource. With its work packages **contributed considerably to the efficiency** of the program and allowed for the kick-off of the operational phase. This increased the speed of the programme implementation. At the end of 2017 most of the work packages were **successfully implemented and completed**.

Key Performance Indicators supports the efficiency of the programme: **Overall number of graduates was higher than planned** (2615 vs 2000), with **twice as many female graduates** as planned (925); Overall number of policy level staff that were capacitated is nearly twice as much as planned (181). **More scholarships were provided** than planned, their number was nearly doubled for females (999). It is interesting to observe that there are less TVET institutions that have staff/ teachers/trainers capacitated to implement WBL than planned (48 vs 58), but **more companies** that have **mentors capacitated** to implement WBL (195 vs planned 160)

Most of the project outputs have been developed and implemented, adding to the **effectiveness (A)** of the project. However, **some initiatives are still active** and will be finalised by the end of March, although formally they have ended. Draft of WBL **legislation framework** was reviewed and is **waiting for final adoption**. The **draft strategy** was prepared and needs a **final discussion** within the TWG, before being endorsed. Specific M&E Indicators for TVET were defined and awaiting final endorsement by Ministries. A **tracer study** executed by an

external company is ongoing to assess the employment outcomes of the WBL Fund. Final results are expected at the end of April.

Within the **WBL Fund** 82 WBL initiatives were implemented with 1,868 trainees from WB and Gaza. 71 initiatives finalized the training and 11 initiatives are still ongoing. 31 initiatives were organised with the **Continuous Vocational Education & Training (CVET) Fund**. The CVET Fund was launched upon special request of the private sector.

There are elements in the project implementation that support the **sustainability (B)** of the project results. There is a **sense of ownership** of the results of the project, both in TVET institutions and in the private sector. TVET institutions have been building their capacity in the development and implementation of the WBL in partnership with the PS and some are extending it to other programmes using their own resources. **New programmes are developed** in the TVET institutions based on the labour market needs. WBL is perceived as the effective tool to serve the demands of the labour market. **Awareness building** about the opportunities that TVET offers is an important element in attracting students. Sustainability is also enhanced through the documents that were produced during the programme implementation.

Unfortunately, the team was not able to meet the Deputy Minister of the MoEHE. This would be important and relevant as the sustainability of many of the outcomes is linked to the institutional level and to changes in TVET legislation and endorsement and implementation of the TVET strategy. **Without a strong political support** this might be difficult and would also jeopardise some achievements in a longer term.

Sustainability depends on the **resources that are needed** to continue activities that were developed within its frame. Some centres continued to apply the WBL from **their own funds** and some of them opened new programs without any external support. Even some companies expressed readiness to cover cost, which shows that they saw their benefit in the WBL scheme.

There are also cases where graduates from the project are ready to support the WBL approach in workshops and during awareness campaigns.

There are **some conditions that affect sustainability**. Many of them are systemic and are linked to actual structure of the system. The most important are presented below, a full overview is presented in the main text.

The TVET sector in Palestine is **fragmented**. The responsibility for TVET is split among different ministries, mainly the MoL and MoEHE with a lack of sufficient coordination and cooperation. This is also due to a lack of capacities (managerial, operational and financial). The **Higher Council for TVET** and the **underlying governance structures**, in particular the Development Centre should in the future contribute to the reduction of this fragmentation.

At the moment there is still **no approved legal framework** for WBL, neither for TVET. Most of the preparatory work has been done, documents prepared and are being reviewed. It will depend on the will of the Palestinian government to finalise the work and develop a bylaw on WBL as part of a more comprehensive TVET law.

Financing of the WBL is an important issue that has to be taken seriously as it is in the very core of the WBL. As the practical part of the training is carried out in companies, **insurance, transportation, and possible incentives** must be provided. Insurance is an important element as students are out of TVET institutions and accidents might happen. Transportation is also an expense for students in particular if the private company is far from their residence. Most of TVET students come from the poor or de-privileged areas and this cost is important and should be covered.

The project used a pro-gender **and pro-poor approach** to attract students to participate in the WBL initiatives. Scholarships that were provided allowed students to enrol in the programmes. Most of them wouldn't be able to participate without a scholarship which is also an important aspect for the sustainability.

It is still premature to decide on the full impact the project will have, but on the basis of examples of the impact that the project is showing it can be given grade **A**. Many of the examples are on individual or local level but show **positive trends and changes** that are happening. **Continuous dialogue** has been established between the TVET institutions and the private sector. Labour market **studies** that are carried out provide valuable information regarding not only the employment needs but also skills and competences that are needed. TVET programmes and initiatives that were implemented generally match better the needs of the labour market. **Tracer studies** are an important element as they follow the employment rate of students that participated in the WBL initiatives and provide valuable feedback for WBL programs developers and implementers. **Students** that participated in the WBL initiatives **feel empowered, are better prepared for the LM** and are often employed by companies where they took their WBL training. There are positive examples of the **empowerment of female students**. The initiatives bring a more **systemic approach** to learning and work and affect both TVET institutions and private sector. Awareness is built in companies regarding safety, health issues, organisation of work and support to the students in the practical part of their training. **Capacities are also built** in the private sector as it provides mentors that are trained by the project, which is also an added value to the company. The project provided **institutional empowerment of TVET institutes and staff** and provided continuous coaching over the period of the implementation.

The ECIB programme is gender sensitive. All relevant indicators in the monitoring matrix are disaggregated according to gender. Target values were set high to promote the gender equality and encourage both schools and girls to participate in the WBL initiatives, also in generally male-dominated occupations. Specific attention was given to **innovative gender-sensitive awareness-raising campaigns** to promote women/girls to enrol in TVET beyond gender stereotypes.

The participation of females was encouraged by the provision of **pro-gender and pro-poor scholarships**. According to the original planning at least 23% of scholarships were to be granted to female students. In the first round of the WBL initiatives their number was double as high and 48% of scholarships were received by girls/women. The last data show that there are twice as many female graduates as planned (925), and that the number of scholarship was nearly doubled for females (999).

Enabel also provided additional support to the gender issues. In 2016 the MoEHE conducted with the support of Belgium and in partnership with the Ministry of Women Affairs (MoWA) a **comprehensive systematic review** of the public education system in Palestine to identify the most significant achievements **in the field of gender equality** and to identify the important gaps and obstacles that prevent (or limit) the integration of gender issues in the education system.

Due to societal constraints **self-employment or working in cooperatives with** other women seems the way forward. The women need support to establish their own business more than the support related to the social culture for the work of the woman. There is a need for awareness related to the work of women- sometimes the reluctance due to social dimensions. There is also a need to **empower** the women **to reach the resources** that would allow them to open their own business.

The ECIB program developed and implements a **gender-sensitive communication plan** and organised innovative gender-sensitive awareness-raising campaigns while taking great care in reaching in particular women/girls in its communication.

Environment as a crosscutting issue was included in TFF in a chapter on the environment. It includes controlling different sources of pollution, promotion of behaviours associated with environment preservation and improvement of systems for waste management. The intervention would support the PA to include the **system of waste management** in the curricula and provide at least one pilot on **green economy**. At the present, students that participate in the WBL initiatives are aware of the environmental issues, however their main focus is on providing **clean environment in the workplace** and taking care of the waste that is produced in the company.

The ECIB program supported initiatives that promote the integration of environmental topics in the TVET-LM subsector such as integration of environmental topics in the curricula used in the WBL schemes; the promotion of WBL initiatives in the domain of green economy: solar systems, waste management, green technology, recycling, green alternatives, etc; and the integration of environmental criteria in the call for WBL proposals.

An important element of **harmonisation** is **collaboration of the two ministries** that are responsible for the TVET sector, both formal and informal. This collaboration will be more systematic with the **reactivation of the Higher Council for TVET** and the appointment of the head of the Development Center. The ECIB project has been closely collaborating and coordinating with other projects in the TVET sector. Establishment of the **Joint Management Structure** provides close collaboration with the MoEHE, MOL, private sector representatives and with the GIZ and a similar structure was created in Gaza including the ministries, private sector, GIZ and IRPAL. Beside the GIZ as the main partner there is also Syntra from Belgium that provides trainings for craftspeople, ILO and ETF. BTC was **regularly briefing the partners** of the on the project as it provides the most reliable source for the future financing of the WBL and its further development as part of the sustainability.

Regarding **alignment**, the project was largely **coherent with the national and sectorial priorities**, in particular from the project reorientation phase (when all main stakeholders provided input and agreed on the changes needed) onwards, as the main stakeholders were involved. This also accounts for the **continuous support** the project is getting at the ministerial and private sector levels (in line with their priorities and the need of properly skilled employees).

The project reports activities implemented towards results. The **monitoring and evaluation framework** was developed during the preparation of the inception study. A revised Logical Framework with more relevant and objective indicators was developed. With reduced number of them (some were still too complex to follow) an **efficient** Monitoring and Evaluation system was put in place and provided necessary feedback to the programmes and its stakeholders and beneficiaries.

TVET-LM **Joint Management Structure (JMS)** established in 2015 has improved coordination and cooperation between two programmes with similar objectives, and avoids duplication, contradictory implementation and overburdening of the (same) partners. It includes **joint planning, joint execution and joint evaluation**. It does **not include joint funding** however, as each partner keeps his full financial autonomy. Besides a Management Committee responsible for strategic decisions and a Programme Committee that functions as the daily management, 5 Thematic Working Groups were established for coordination of all the concrete actions in their respective domain. **The system works well**; the main challenge is financing of the initiatives as TVET institutions do not have their own account and it is difficult to make necessary transfers for the activities that are carried out.

There is a **strong feeling of ownership** of the project in both ministries, the focal points and in the Thematic Working Groups. The ownership is in particular strong in TVET institutions that developed the new initiatives and established links with the private sector. The WBL approach offered them **a window of opportunity** to provide TVET of higher quality, based on the local labour market needs and also develop their own capacities. Some TVET institutions also continued the development of the new programmes on their own as it gives them also a **comparative advantage** on the market.

Which future interventions could encourage graduates to become self-employed (Q1)?

Experiences from the implementation of the WBL and tracking of students show that some of them are employed after graduating from their course/programme. However, **job opportunities are limited** in Palestine and even more limited in Gaza. Many graduates decide to be self-employed and open their own business. Some initiatives provided graduates with tools at the end of their training and it helped them to start working. There are **different options for providing support** to graduates. The most important is to **develop their entrepreneurial skills and competences**. This should also go hand in hand with providing opportunities to be part of the **incubators or co-sharing workspace** as for many graduates space is a big problem due to connected costs. Opportunities should be offered to graduates to start in an incubator

where they could develop their own business. Co-working space also gives an opportunity for start-ups and also provides individuals or groups opportunity for cooperation or collaboration. Graduates also need mentoring and coaching as part of the continuous training. **Networking** is also an option for providing individuals more work or business opportunities, connecting offer and demand, collaboration and cooperation, support.

The **viability of the new businesses** depends on two factors, the **right support at the right time**, in particular under the form of high-quality tailor-made business support services, and the extent to which they have **access to finances**, from their own resources or from external sources. For the first one, the following support can be provided them: expertise on general business management, marketing, market penetration, HR-management, technology, product costing and pricing, financial management accounting, etc. The most important success factor is **the overall quality and relevance** of the offered services as well as the proper preparation, guidance and follow up over a longer period of time, applying a **coaching** rather than training approach.

Regarding the second factor, finances, lending or obtaining funds for productive investments in Palestine is difficult either due to the reluctance of micro-credit institutions and banks or is considered as not appropriate by the client for cultural or religious reasons. Facilitation of the access to finance for young enterprises could be done by **offering grants** under or by supporting young enterprises to obtain financing from **external resources**.

What are the options for better meeting the needs of companies (Q2)? There are different options. The future intervention should focus on the **infrastructure and institutions** that **provide most support** (e.g. associations, federations etc). Through discussion with different stakeholders it seems that **sector associations** would be the best partner in defining the training needs in the companies as part of their professional development. Private sector should be also included in the development of the new training programmes. Active involvement in all stages will also contribute to the relevance and quality of the programmes. **Links** with the TVET institutions should be also **reinforced** as they provide benefit for both sides, as shown during the implementation of the WBL initiatives. Companies should also provide **continuous development for their employees** which would give them a comparative advantage. It is also important to provide training that meet the needs of companies.

In Palestine 90% of the businesses are family-owned micro, small and medium businesses, responsible for the vast majority of jobs. The Palestinian economy and population would benefit from an improved business environment supported by a **solid network of private sector umbrella organisations** that could offer quality services to their members.

There are different options for this support. Based on the experience of ECIB programme it is important to **strengthen private sector umbrella organisations** in their role as service providers to their members and as structuring agents of the economy, as they are closest to their members and they know their needs. It would be also important to provide **high-quality business support services (BSS)** and guarantee the overall quality of the services, tailored to the needs of companies. The third element is an **Innovation Fund** to support existing enterprises to become more competitive through access to new technology and production techniques, expertise and business support services, access to (new) markets, HRD, international networking, and other services.

To prevent possible pitfalls when upscaling WBL at the national level and to assure sustainability (Q3) of ECIB results there are certain conditions that need to be fulfilled. **Legislation and strategy** need to be in place. ECIB implementation showed that there is willingness for the development of both strategy and legal framework, but processes are very slow and need a strong political support. It is compulsory that both legislation and strategy are in place before clearly defined and agreed roles. It is important to build **good communication and collaboration** in the system with all stakeholders. In particular establishing channels between TVET institutions and the private sector, with the ministries providing such an environment that will be conducive for the full introduction on the WBL in Palestine.

The analysis of the project results drove to a list of **conclusions**:

- The ECIB programme is still **very relevant** for Palestine as it is in line with the priorities and development policies of the Palestinian government at the national and local level as well as with priorities of the Belgian government and EU.
- The draft **strategy and legislation** provide a framework for the implementation of the work-based learning into TVET and the institutional arrangements, with the Higher Council and establishment of the Development Centre.
- After a slow start the programme became **very efficient**. The revised TFF provided a clear roadmap to the project but there were also important changes in the project's human resource. With its **work packages** contributed considerably to the efficiency of the program and allowed for the kick-off of the operational phase. This increased the speed of the programme implementation. At the end of 2017 most of the work packages were **successfully implemented and completed**.
- In the **WBL Fund** 82 work-based learning initiatives were carried out in Palestine, 65 in the West Bank and 17 in Gaza. Budget was 1.3 M Euro with additional 600.000 Euro matching Scholarship Fund. There were 1,868 trainees, (1,235 male and 633 females); and 71 initiatives finalized the training and 11 initiatives are still ongoing and will be finalized at the end of March.
- In the second fund, Continuous **Vocational Education & Training (CVET) Fund** there were 31 selected initiatives (West Bank:17, Gaza:14), with the budget of 165,480 Euro (West Bank: 96,000 Euro, Gaza: 69,480 Euro). There were short specialized training courses with the duration between 2 and 6 months. Out of 31 initiatives 25 had a WBL component. In West bank there were 250 trainees (153 males, 97 females), and in Gaza 236 (163 males, 73 females).
- The **WBL initiatives are based on the needs of the labour market** and TVET programmes were developed with the participation of the private sector. Students are better equipped for the demands of the labour market and have greater chances to find employment. Some of them were immediately employed by companies where they took the practical part of the training.
- A **great number of initiatives** provided the WBL as part of the TVET programmes both in the **formal and informal system (CVET)**. The initiatives are based on the adaptation of existing programmes or development of new ones, without specific methodology that could or should be used. This approach will allow the analysis of different possibilities and provide answers to some questions regarding the mainstreaming of the WBL.
- The ECIB programme provided **capacity building on the national and local level** and built the awareness about its importance and modalities for its implementation. Monitoring of initiatives will provide additional information about the implementation and feedback to TVET institutions.
- A provisional **multi-stakeholder TVET-LM Management Structure** was also established with the aim to improve coordination and to promote joint actions in the subsector. **Five Thematic Working Groups** were also established to coordinate all the concrete actions in their respective domain. Six focal have been monitoring the implementation of all the WBL initiatives.
- The sustainability of the project depends mainly on the **systemisation of the TVET sector**. Establishment of the Higher Council, Development Centre, TVET legislation, enacting of the Training Fund, are issues that depend on the government level and their priorities.
- **Pro-poor and pro-gender support** that was provided by the ECIB programme made a difference for the beneficiaries. Without this contribution they wouldn't be able to attend the TVET training. It's an important component that needs further support.

The evaluation provides a number of **recommendations** for the project, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education, the Ministry of Labour, the Private Sector and Enabel. The most relevant for each of the actors are:

- **For the MoEHE and MoL**
- Provide a **consistent governance structure** for the TVET through the Higher Council for TVET and the Development Centre.

- Provide the **legal framework for the WBL** as part of TVET based on the documents that have been prepared by the ECIB project and provide support in the discussion and endorsement phase.
- Financing of WBL is part of financing of TVET. Coordinated approach should be used to provide **legal basis for financing** and define resources.
- **Include social partners** (in particular private sector) in the development and revisions of TVET programmes from the very beginning.
- **Continue providing support to Gaza** taking into account the specific situation there.
- **For the Private Sector – FPCCIA and PFI**
 - Seek an **active role** in the development and revisions of TVET programmes based on the LM needs.
 - Provide **further support for the partnership** between TVET institutions and private sector.
 - **Disseminate good practices and success stories.**
- **For the Project team**
 - **Finalise the exit strategy** taking into account the sustainability of the project results.
 - Explore **possible involvements in other sectors** (e.g. agriculture).
- **For the Project Management Team**
 - **Follow closely the activities regarding legislation** (WP1) as time is limited due to long procedures at the government level.
 - Provide **different options for the Training Fund.**
 - **Support Gaza** with further trainings and capacity building activities to reinforce what has already been achieved.
- **For Enabel**
 - **Build the new programme on the results of the ECIB programme.**
 - **Provide support through the JFA for work-based initiatives.**

There were some **lessons learnt** that could help with the future programmes and projects:

- Cooperation between TVET institutions and the private sector has been established in different projects but was in most cases not sustained for long after the end of the project. It is important to find a mechanism that would provide a sustainable structure ready for supporting future intervention. The new projects shouldn't look for new bodies but try to rewrite, if needed, the mandate of the existing councils. Participation of councils in different projects would also ensure them stable financing.
- Skills development for ToT and mentors in the labour market: the intervention resulted to empowering the staff from the private sector, as it exposed them to exchange experiences with their counterparts from the TVET institutions.
- Full partnership existed on all levels: local, governorate, Federations associations, institutions and all stakeholders were closer together, being from the central entities (the ministries or unions of federations), or from the institutions in the governorates on the local- regional levels,..., as the project necessitated the coordination and collaboration. This reflected positively and will have its effects for future cooperation, even after the concluding of the project under this intervention.
- Sometimes the time constraints worked against the implementation, there is a need for more time in the future. It should be taken into consideration that some initiatives are different than the others, resulting in allowing for flexibility in overseeing the implementation for some activities, as per the nature and specify of each.
- The experience of the WBL initiatives in the framework of the ECIB programme resulted into allowing some centers to start a new WBL program without the external support.
- Students learned how to live with real situations while being under the WBL scheme. This had given rise to both the students and their institutions to live real situations during the implementation in contrast with the traditional field training schemes, where the

attendance of the student had sometimes taken the form of being in the workplace just as a prerequisite to the grade.

- Previously, the relations between the supply side and demand side were on personal basis, after the WBL it became institutionalized: this fact was elaborated through the evaluating the submitted proposals and the benefits and incentives seen by the employers.

The report also provides **examples of good practices** from a number of TVET institutions and private sector companies that were visited during the field visits and where discussions were held with different stakeholders. **Benefits of the work based learning** are reiterated at the end of the report.