



Belgische Technische Coöperatie nv
Coopération Technique Belge sa

FINAL REPORT

TRAINING FACILITY PROJECT LAO/03/005/11

BASIC INFORMATION ON THE PROJECT

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| Country | : | Lao PDR |
| DAC Sector and sub-sector | : | Training in Multi-Sectors |
| National or regional institution in charge of the execution: | | MOFA/CPI and MoE |
| Agencies in charge of the execution | : | Lao Government and BTC |
| Number of BTC international cooperation experts: | | 1 (Resident Representative) |
| Duration of the project (according to SA/SC) | : | 4 years (incl. project formulation) |
| Start date of the project: | | |
| according to SA/SC | : | 14 th May 2003 |
| effective | : | 1 st November 2004 |
| End date of the project: | | |
| according to SA/SC | : | 15 th May 2008 (extended) |
| estimate | : | 31 st March 2008 |
| Project management methods | : | Co-management |
| Project total budget | : | 750,000 € |
| Report covering the period | : | 1 st Nov 2004 – 31 st Mar 2008 |

| Annexes | Yes | No |
|---|-----|----|
| 1. Results summary | ✓ | |
| 2. Situation of receipts and expenses for the year considered | ✓ | |
| 3. Disbursement rate of the project | ✓ | |
| 4. Personnel of the project | ✓ | |
| 5. Subcontracting activities and invitations to tender | ✓ | |
| 6. Equipments | ✓ | |
| 7. Trainings | ✓ | |
| 8. Backers | | ✓ |

PART ONE: APPRAISAL

Evaluate the relevance and the performance of the project by means of the following assessments:

- 1.** - *Very satisfactory*
2. - *Satisfactory*
3. - *Non satisfactory, in spite of some positive elements*
4. - *Non satisfactory*
X. - *Unfounded*

Write down your answer in the column corresponding to your functions during the project execution :

| | National execution official | BTC execution official |
|---|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|
| RELEVANCE¹ (cf. PRIMA, §70, p.19) | | |
| 1. Is the project relevant compared to the national development priorities? | 1 | 1 |
| 2. Is the project relevant compared to the Belgian development policy? | | |
| Indicate your result according to the three themes below: | | |
| a) Gender | 1 | 1 |
| b) Environment | 2 | 2 |
| c) Social economy | 2 | 1 |
| 3. Were the objectives of the project always relevant? | 1 | 1 |
| 4. Did the project meet the needs of the target groups? | 2 | 2 |
| 5. According to its objectives, did the project rely on the appropriate local execution organs? | 1 | 2 |

¹ According to PRIMA, §70, p.19, it is a matter "of appreciating if the choices regarding to the objectives, the target groups and the local execution organs remain relevant and consistent according to the general principles of a useful and efficient aid, and according to the execution of the local, regional, international and Belgian development policies and strategies"

| | National execution official | BTC execution official |
|--|--|---------------------------------------|
| RELEVANCE² (PRIMA, §71, pp.19-20) | | |
| 1. Did the results of the project contribute to the carrying out of its objectives ³ ? (efficiency) | 2 | 2 |
| 2. Evaluate the intermediate results (efficiency) | 2 | 2 |
| 3. Are the management methods of the project appropriated? (efficiency) | 2 | 2 |
| 4. Were the following resources appropriated (efficiency) : | | |
| a. Financial means? | 2 | 1 |
| b Human resources? | 2 | 2 |
| c. Material and equipments? | 2 | 2 |
| 5. Were the project resources effectively used and optimized in order to reach the foreseen results? (efficiency) | 2 | 2 |
| 6. Was the project satisfactory on a cost-efficiency approach in comparison to similar interventions? (efficiency) | 1 | 2 |
| 7. According to the execution planning, assess the speed of the execution (respect of deadlines) | 2 | 2 |

² According to PRIMA, §71, pp. 19-20, it is a matter of "appreciate and measure the foreseen performances agreed during the preparation traineeships according to the 4 criteria and the indicators established during the formulation. (The 4 criteria are efficiency, suitability, respect of deadlines and quality of the personnel)"

³ See annex 1 for further information

Indicate your global evaluation of the project by means of the following appreciations:

- 1 - Very satisfactory
- 2 - Satisfactory
- 3 - Non satisfactory, in spite of some positive elements
- 4 - Non satisfactory
- X - Unfounded

| | National execution official | BTC execution official |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Global evaluation of the project | 2 | 2 |

Comment your evaluation, which can be broader than the strict framework of the abovementioned relevance and performance criteria and differ from the given evaluation.

(1 page max)

Relevancy:

Most of the training proposals submitted by the government institutions are in line with the national development strategies especially the National Growth Poverty Eradication Strategy (NGPES) as well as the priorities of their institutions. The objectives of the project are still relevant since the nation aims to release from the poverty by the year 2020.

The needs of the target groups are met for some extent by provision of financial support to training initiatives for varieties of people on central and provincial/district as well as village levels. The Mid-Term Review (MTR) concluded that the project is highly relevant to the needs of Laos and its people. With its pro-poor focus and its concentration on training and capacity development, it is fully in accordance with the expectations and priorities of the beneficiaries – and also in accordance with Belgian policies and strategies.

Impact and Effectiveness:

The project results particularly R1 and R2 certainly contributed to the project objectives. In this regard the project mechanism is in place and a wide variety of training initiatives carried out with satisfaction by the beneficiaries. The MTR also insisted that R1 and R2 are achieved with good progress while application and multiplication initiatives (R3 and R4) have been realized for some extent in 2007.

The co-management method creates transparency and cooperation, but takes more time on decision-making especially when project partners are busy with their routine jobs

Efficiency:

Since the Project Coordination Unit (PCU) has limited number of staff, the existing government structure especially on provincial level has been relied on for the supervision of the implementation of the training initiatives in the fields. For example, a representative department signed contract(s) with the Training Facility (TF) project and a group of committee was set with



the role of supervising the implementation of certain training courses including control of training evaluation by mean of pre-test and post test.

Sustainability:

There is a promise from the partner and beneficiary institutions in applying and multiplying the knowledge and skills obtained from the training activities. During the monitoring visits it is found that beneficiaries are satisfied with the training results. The beneficiaries particularly who benefited from vocational trainings funded by TF are carrying out post-training application and multiplication activities with the obtained knowledge and skills as well as remaining equipment or produces from previous training courses.

However, the ongoing activity like the in-country scholarships needs to be followed up by the partner institutions especially the Department of Higher Technical and Vocational Education (DHTVE), of Ministry of Education (MoE) and the Department of International Cooperation (DIC), Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI). In the service contracts, the students signed to return home after completion of their education and contribute to the socio-economic development of their residential provinces. The PCU prepared the student's profiles that will be provided and followed up by responsible government institutions after closing of TF.

Following the Specific Agreement (SA), all purchased equipment and archives will be handed over to the Lao PDR with the closure of the TF. It is expected that the beneficial ministries and departments will utilize the handed over assets into further strengthening of their capacity and institutional development activities.

| National execution official | BTC execution official |
|---|--|
|  |  |

PART TWO: SUMMARY OF THE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION.

- 1. If necessary, describe the Specific objectives and the Intermediate results of the project, as mentioned in the project document, as well as the implemented changes (when, how and why).**

1 page max.

Over the project life time the following objectives and expected results have not been changed. The overall objective still complies with the Lao PDR Socio-Economic Development Strategies and Plans and the National Growth Poverty Eradication Strategy (NGPES) which is valid until 2020.

Overall Objective:

The Overall Objective of the Training Facility is to reduce poverty and contribute to socio-economic development in Laos through capacity and institutional building.

Specific Objective:

Its Specific Objective is to improve capabilities of Laotians by facilitating their participation in a wide variety of training initiatives

Expected Results:

- Result 1: An efficient mechanism for facilitating training has been put into operation.
- Result 2: Candidates selected have been successfully participated in training initiatives.
- Result 3: Knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training are effectively applied.
- Result 4: Knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training are effectively multiplied.

- 2. To which extent was the specific objective of the project reached, according to the accepted indicators?**

1 page max.

Indicator:

Improved status (professional, intellectual, social, psychological and/or financial) of trainee upon return.

Assessment:

In comparison between the pre-tests and post-tests by the trainees, their knowledge and skills have been positively improved. Obviously, the trainees returned home and practiced the obtained knowledge and skills for social benefit and family incomes particularly those who attended technical and vocational training activities. A number of

those trainees already possessed some level of professional knowledge and skills in the subjects and followed training to become more qualified. In longer term, the trained people will be able to play a greater role in poverty eradication in line with the national strategy that aims to build up skilled labors to gradually response to the market demands

Indicator:

Improved status of institute of employment thanks to contribution of trainee (e.g. increased demand for services)

Assessment:

Full assessment has not been done after training. However, the institutes of employment confirmed at the end of the training courses that the obtained knowledge and skills will enhance the service of their employees and will strengthen the institutional development. The beneficiary institutions and training providers expressed sincere gratitude and thanks to the Training Facility, particularly the Lao government and BIC for financial support in a wide range of capacity building that is not covered by other development programs and projects.

3. To which extent were the intermediate results of the project reached, according to the accepted indicators?

2 pages max.

Result 1: An efficient mechanism for facilitating training has been put into operation.

- a. According to the budget modified during FIT migration process in March 2005 an amount of 738,168.15 € is available for the TF implementation. Up to March 2008, 100% of co-management budget is disbursed and 99% is spent. Only 50% of small REGIE budget is spent to date and in total 98% is financially achieved. However, the total balance up to 24 March is 15,550.47 € and it is forecasted that the final balance after paying salary and pensions for TF staff and some expenses for office as well as project closing events will be approx. 1,447.29 €. **The disbursement is achieved for a great extent.** Please see Annex 1 and 2 for additional information.
- b. Regarding the accessibility of information and documentation, training guideline, application forms and other related documents have been provided to potential candidates and interested individuals and organizations with explanation prior to submission of their proposals and reports accordingly. **This aspect is somehow achieved;**
- c. There is a **high level of transparency** as co-management method has been used in decision-making through different levels of meetings. However, co-management method sometimes consumes a lot of time that could delay the documentation and authorization process for some extent. **The procedure is not really simplified** and needs to be improved for greater speed in project implementation. This is also considered as one of the lessons learnt.
- d. Although high workload has been put on the small PCU, its staff members worked hard in project implementation in collaboration with existing governmental organs. This is proved by MTR for a high level of efficiency.
- e. **Fairly good quality of support given** by the Training Facility PCU, to the beneficiaries.

- f. **The total number of applicants are greater than the number of candidates selected** since many of the submitted proposals did not match with project objectives and priority sectors⁴ stipulated in the practical guideline for Training Facility implementation.
- g. **The total numbers of candidates are smaller than the number of trainees effectively facilitated** as more interested people attended in some respective training courses with the authorization of implementing agencies without payment.

Result 2: Candidates selected have been successfully participated in training initiatives.

- a. There are 5,936 trainees in total including 2,044 females and there is no any dropout for such short courses or at least there are replacements with new people
- b. There are 919 trainees facilitated under TF Priority Sector 1; 196 for sector 2; 3,317 for sector 3; 1,196 for sector 4; 0 trainee for sector 5; and 308 trainees for sector 6 (see sector details at the footnote of this page or in Annex 1 and 7)
- c. There are 5,936 trainees enrolled in total and it is found that the number of trainees that completed the training are greater than the number of trainees enrolled due to other interested people attended in many training courses without payment.
- d. Although the training courses are quite short, trainers and beneficial institutions proved that those trainings produced positive results. This has been confirmed at the end of each training course by the trainees and implementing agencies
- e. The MTR found that the TF is appreciated by the beneficiaries.
- f. They satisfy with TF and need further support

Result 3: Knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training are effectively applied.

- a. According to the post-tests and evaluation results, the knowledge and skills of the trainees are increased and they satisfied and proposed for further training. They are also convinced that they have more confidence to do their jobs. It is found that many of the trained people are applying the obtained knowledge and skills particularly with regards to vocational activities. In this regard, the aim of most training courses provided is to strengthen and maximize their existing capacities that have been used within their institutions of employment.
- b. The institutes of employment expressed sincere gratitude and thanks to Training Facility, particularly the Lao government and BIC for financial support in building and strengthening capacities of their staffs.
- c. Some evaluation studies were carried out and further support to application initiatives and refresher training were provided.

⁴ Sector: 1) Public Administration Reform (including Decentralization and Human Resource Management); 2) Human rights (including police training); 3) Technical and Vocational Training; 4) Rural Development; 5) Environment; 6) Public health.

Result 4: Knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training are effectively multiplied.

- a. The trainees who attended in ToT courses satisfied with the training results and transfer are carried out in different technical and vocational schools. This also convinced the TF beneficiary institutions.
- b. The institutes of employment also satisfied with multiplication of training results and requested for further support.
- c. Many multiplication initiatives under different TF priority sectors were facilitated in 2007.

4. Describe the follow-up evaluation system established when the project was implemented.

The PCU established a simple database on Excel in order to keep tracks of training activities funded by TF. This simple database recorded the following information:

- The numbers of all Service Contracts signed per year;
- Name of the contract partners and/or training providers
- The numbers of training courses under the respective contracts classified by TF priority sectors and contracted budget;
- The number of trainees classified by gender, area base (central and provinces);
- The numbers of training courses are also classified in different scenarios or ranges as recommended by backstopping mission in March 2007 (see Annex 1):
 - 1) **By Participants** ranging from 1 person; 2 to 5; 6 to 10; 11 to 20; 21 to 50; 51 to 100 and >100 persons;
 - 2) **By Budget** ranging from \$1-\$500; \$500-\$1,000; \$1,001-\$5,000; \$5,001-\$10,000; \$10,001-\$20,000; \$20,001-\$50,000; and +\$50,001;
 - 3) **By TF Priority Sector, Participants and Budget**

In order to obtain the above-mentioned sets of information, the PCU has carried out day-to-day monitoring and follow up of the training activities in the field and from distance. Since the PCU has a limited number of staff and a high workload, field monitoring and supervisions were mainly assigned to the training providers and executing agencies represented in different provinces as per contract. In this regard, pre-test and post-tests evaluations were done by trainees and implementing agencies. Training committees were set up to carry out supervision of training implementation.

In addition, guidelines and forms for narrative and financial reports were designed and provided to implementing agencies or providers with explanation before and during the training activity. The database was periodically updated with information obtained from field monitoring visits and reports made by implementing agencies and providers.

PART THREE: COMMENTS AND ANALYSIS.

1. What are the major problems and questions having influenced the project implementation and how did the project attempt to solve them?

1 page max.

The procedure for application and authorization of training funds was not simplified enough as it involved the following practical steps and it takes long time particularly when respective authorizers are not around.

- a. **Announcement of Training Facility** (verbally done whenever possible) and provision of training forms and guidelines with explanation;
- b. The potential of interested institutions **prepare the training proposals and submit it directly to TF** through line ministries. Many of them submitted proposals in different format as information on TF might reached them through another channel;
- c. The **PCU registers, screens and pre-selects** the submitted proposals based on project guidelines and criteria;
- d. The PCU submitted the pre-selected proposals to JSC for **final selection** through a JSC (selection) meeting;
- e. The PCU **informs** the candidates or institutions whose proposals are selected in order to collect additional information and clarification with regard to proposed budget and training implementation modalities. At this step the information and negotiation will be sent back and forth that leaves some gaps for many proposals;
- f. The PCU **prepares different contracts in the same periods and submit it to JSC and contract partner for signatures**. At this step, it often delays, especially when contract with payment requests and report forms have to be sent to the province by EMS for signature and then return to TF;
- g. The TF Accountant issues check(s), submits for authorization by both Project Coordinators for amount up to 3,000 USD or by Authorizing Officers for amount exceed 3,000 USD according to TF financial guideline. Then money is transferred to the bank account of the contract partner according to the required date specified in the Payment Request which is also signed by the respective authorizers;
- h. The provider finalizes logistics and conducts the training courses. At this step, the PCU carries out the field monitoring and evaluation.

The PCU had a high workload with limited number of staff. Therefore, the PCU relied on the existing structure of the government to assist in monitoring and evaluation as well as supervision of training activities in the field as much as possible. In addition, the TF has hired a Project Assistant.

Guidelines for Training Facility were not timely reviewed and revised to match with the situation e.g. the training material cost is fixed at 10% of the total cost which affected on

small scaled activities. In practice, the material cost could be greater than 10% which was considered case by case, but it was not documented in written form.

Some training providers have low capacity and skills in preparation of financial reports in fairly good quality, although the instruction was made and the guideline provided in advance by the PCU. This might be because of some of them delegated the reporting task to another staff with insufficient explanation. This area of capacity building could have done the during the orientation workshop. The financial report format might also require too much detail.

Lack of project car for day-to-administration as well as for monitoring and evaluation trips and the PCU had to look for car service providers.

2. Which factors explain the differences in relation to the awaited results?

1 page max.

There are some changes in terms of budget for training operation (A_02_01) under Result 2, as the in-country scholarships were approved by a Steering Committee meeting in 2006. In this regard, a ceiling amount of 150,000 € under A_02_01 was booked for those scholarships which were originally not foreseen. At the beginning, TF focused on implementation of Result 2. Therefore, the budget under other budget lines remained unspent, instead budget under A_02_01 has small balance. Thus, modifications were made on the original TF budget in 2007, and the SC approved a shifting of other budgets to A_02_01 for further training operation as detailed below:

-
- 13,705.65 € shifted from Monitoring and Evaluation (Z_01_02)
- 25,000.00 € shifted from Working Cost (Z_01_03)
- 5,859.10 € shifted from Unforeseen (Z_01_05)
- 27,564.46 € is transferred from Training Multiplication (A_04_01) and Training Application (A_03_01) as the SC members perceived that the activities under these results could not be implemented due to time constraints.
- **99,693.67 € shifted to A_02_01 in total**

3. Which lessons can we learn from the project experience? Please give a detailed answer on the impact and the durability of the results.

2 pages max.

- At the beginning of the project, many proposals submitted were not in line with the TF guideline since they were prepared before the completion of the guideline. Therefore, the screening process took a long time and was very time-consuming for the project staff members;
- It is good to keep procedures as simple as possible in order to reduce workloads on limited number of staff and it should be timely reviewed and revised;

- Many interested agencies might have wrong understanding on the training facility project since there was no orientation workshop conducted among the project stakeholders and verbal announcements might be varied;
- Putting announcement on training facility on other media e.g. TV, radio broadcast and newspapers may be insufficient as access to those media is quite limited and ignored by the local people. However, the local people met during the recent field visits were convinced that it would be more helpful and better understood through direct approach and talk with them;
- The distance and the remoteness of the beneficiary's locality caused some difficulties in communications and the proposal screening process last long;
- The legal procedures often take long time for the import of project goods e.g. procurement of project motorbike with tax exemption;
- Government trainers are pleased to provide training services with fair price and the applicants also helped find trainers for their desired training programs;
- Project implementation through partner promotes good ownership;
- The Lao partner confirmed that the training fund might not be sustainable, but the trainees can still personally and officially apply the knowledge and skills obtained from the training courses. However, it is not easy to measure to what extent.
- It is convinced that Training Facility responds to the training needs across sectors from central to grass-root levels. It is also a basis for income generation opportunities for local population benefited from the training initiatives.

4. According to you, how was the project perceived by the target groups?

According to my observation and field visit experience the target groups perceived that Training Facility is a very useful mean to build capacity for the government staff as well as the disadvantage people. It is good that Training Facility has provided funds for a wide variety of training activities that are ignored by other development projects and programmes.

Both trainees and beneficiary institutions expressed gratitude and sincere thanks for this great effort, which is in line with the National Growth Poverty Eradication Strategy (NGPES). In this regard, Training Facility helps to achieve immediate needs of the rural poor in self-sufficiency and food security.

However, the trainees and beneficiary institutions often mention that Training Facility provided quite limited fund and is quite short in its services as it is new for them. Therefore, they always asked for further support even in the future, which is not sure that this kind of project will exist again.

5. Did the follow-up evaluation or the monitoring, and the possible audits and controls have any results? How were the recommendations taken into account?

2 pages max.

a) Mid-Term Review (MTR) – October 2006

The MTR mission team came up with a set of findings and recommendations for different stakeholders. Many of the recommendations for the project have been implemented e.g. exchange visit with other TF initiatives, more training opportunities for PCU members, recruitment of additional staff to PCU, replenishment of funds, extension of the project, further use of the existing government structure, etc.

b) BTC Internal Audit

The internal financial audit was carried out by a BTC officer from HQ from 4 -12 June 2006. Some recommendations made during the briefing meeting with regard to simplification of the financial procedures. For example: put DSA, accommodation, etc, in one sheet to save payment and signatures; all invoices must be stamped; Euro currency is not allowed to pay cash, etc. These recommendations were implemented by the TF.

c) Backstopping by BTC-HQ

In March 2007, Education and Training Advisor of BIC HQ visited IF Laos in the presence of the Project Coordinator of IF Cambodia. The backstopping mission helped strengthen the two TF projects in identification of training Application and multiplication initiatives. The backstopping mission included field visits to beneficiary institutions in Vientiane and in Luangprabang province in northern part of Laos. The TF projects continued with field visits to the middle provinces e.g. Khammouane and Bolikhamxay in order to identify further application and multiplication initiatives which were later on implemented in provinces. The TF was advised to prepare training documents in different scenarios and in easy-to-read format. This advice was successfully implemented (see annex 7).

The progress against MTR recommendations was also reviewed with the two TF projects to ensure that those recommendations are still valid and applicable during the remaining time of the TF projects.

It was recommended that for the phasing out strategy, the TF should continue utilizing the existing structure of the partner institutions at different levels as recommended by the MTR. More involvement should be considered and ownership of counterparts in project implementation stages. Materials and equipment can be directly handed over as some of them are being utilized by the counterpart officers. The key materials and equipment have been recorded in an inventory list that is available in IF and BIC Offices so far (see Annex 6 – equipment).

d) TF Financial Audit by external

The process of selection of an audit firm was carried out by the PCU, with support from JSC and the BTC Representative Office in Phnom Penh, Cambodia. IF Laos adapted the documents used for a recent audit of IF in Cambodia e.g. ToR, selection table and criteria and the service contract.

The PCU sent the invitation letter and other related documents to four or five audit firms requesting for submission of their audit proposals. Unfortunately, some audit firms confirmed the receipt of the document and only one of them submitted the technical and financial

proposal although deadline was extended for two more days and follow up emails and telephone calls made. Therefore, ACCMIN Consulting and Services Co; Ltd, was jointly selected and awarded by JSC members on November 14th 2007 on the basis of the set criteria and the service contract was signed by the two parties on November 16th 2007. The actual audit took course on November 19th 2007 following the international audit standard. The final audit report was submitted to the PCU in the later time after the payment was made.

6. **Which are your recommendations for the consolidation and the appropriation of post-project period (policy to be followed or implemented, necessary national resources, makes target groups aware of their responsibilities, way to apply the recommendations ...)? 2 pages max.**

- a) **Ensuring that the ongoing scholarships are followed up and monitored by the Lao partners after the end of the project.** There are 46 students including 27 females (44 in started in academic year of 2006 and 2 in 2007); 12 students study Bachelor Degree and 34 of them study on technical and higher diploma level.
- b) **The provincial and district authorities have to ensure that all students return home after completion of their study and they will have to ensure the quota of employment as stipulated in the scholarship contracts.** The technical and higher diploma will take 2-3 years and 5 years for Bachelor Degree started September 2007 and all students will probably finish their study latest in June 2011.
- c) **Making the procedure for facilitating Training Facility as simple as possible to ensure that the project implementation has good speed and meets the deadline.** All necessary guidelines and tools need to be reviewed and revised on time to allow more efficient project implementation particularly for the future programming.
- d) **More full-time positions are needed for future Training Facility project (if any).** The additional full-time positions foreseen are Project Coordinator (from partner ministry), Accountant Assistant and Monitoring and Evaluation Expertise (BIC contractual).
- e) **Project office should be annexed to the office of a partner ministry.** This will allow closer coordination between project and partner staffs as well as to help strengthening the partner office in terms of capacity building and office facilities;
- f) **Implementing recommendations of MTR, backstopping and audit missions.** To check where those recommendations are still valid and can be implemented in the future Training Facility project.

7. **Conclusions**

1 page max.

Result 1: *An efficient mechanism for facilitating training has been put into operation.*

The TF office was set up and necessary equipment and furniture were procured for project implementation facility. The PCU staff members were occasionally trained within customized and non-customized training courses. The guidelines and tools were in place and utilized. Coordination with stakeholders was established and simple database was set up to keep record and tracing the trainees. **Therefore, the area of mechanism has successfully**

implemented. However, the simplicity of procedure and staffing issue needs to be taken into account for improvement in the future project placement.

Result 2: *Candidates selected have been successfully participated in training initiatives.*



A wide range of training courses, workshops and study tours were successfully facilitated per type of TF priority sectors. The trainees and beneficiary institutions appreciate the TF. It is concluded that this result is somehow achieved for a great extent and in-country scholarships need to be further followed up by Lao partners.

Result 3: *Knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training are effectively applied.*

Although the activities under this result were not fully implemented due to time constraint, it was found that the trained people are applying the knowledge and skills obtained from the training courses funded by TF. Only a number of application initiatives are supported by TF in the fourth quarter of 2007. This result has been achieved for some extent and needs to be taken into account as priority if the project is extended.

Result 4: *Knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training are effectively multiplied.*

This result has similar status as the result 3 as both results have been implemented at the same time and the budgets were combined. Additionally, the partner and beneficiary institutions were convinced that the knowledge and skills obtained from the Training of Trainers (ToT) courses were transferred to more people. In this regard, at least the teachers in technical and vocational schools taught the technical and vocational lessons for the students and interested farmers. This result has also been achieved for some extent and needs to be taken into account as priority if the project is extended.

| National execution official | BTC execution official |
|---|--|
|  |  |

PART THREE. ANNEXES.

| Annexes |
|---|
| Annex 1 Results summary |
| Annex 2 Situation of receipts and expenses |
| Annex 3 Disbursement rate of the project |
| Annex 4 Personnel of the project |
| Annex 5 Subcontracting activities |
| Annex 6 Equipments |
| Annex 7 Trainings |
| Annex 8 Backers |

ANNEX 1. Results and activities summary (according to the logical framework)

| Intermediate Results | Indicators (foreseen or realized) | Progress |
|--|---|---|
| IR. 1. An efficient mechanism for facilitating training has been put into operation. | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disbursement of training fund following planning. 2. Accessibility of information and documentation to potential candidates. 3. Transparency and simplicity of procedures. 4. Efficiency of administration. 5. Quality of support given 6. Evolution of the total number of applicants versus number of candidates selected. 7. Evolution of the total number of candidates versus number of trainees effectively facilitated. | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. As TF implementation was effective from November 2004, information on financial planning was not available, but 150,000 € was disbursed. In 2005, the amount of 137,800 € was disbursed. A total amount of 165,700 € was disbursed in 2006; 255,000 € was disbursed in 2007 and 16,998.15 € in 2008. In total 725,498.15 € (100% of co-management budget) is disbursed by end of the project. 2. Training guideline, application forms and other related documents have been provided to potential candidates and interested individuals and organizations. 3. Project has used co-management method and simple guidelines are in place. 4. A very large range of training courses have been administered by the small PCU in collaboration with beneficial institutions. 5. Fairly good quality of support given. 6. The total numbers of applicants are greater than the number of candidates selected. 7. The total numbers of candidates are smaller than the number of trainees effectively facilitated as more interested people attended in some respective training courses with the authorization of implementing agencies. |
| IR. 2. Candidates selected have successfully participated in training initiatives. | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Overall number of trainees facilitated and percentage of dropouts after selection and during training. 2. Number of trainees facilitated per type of programme and per sector. 3. Number of trainees enrolled versus number of trainees who completed their training. 4. Official results of Training 5. Appreciation of trainees by their trainer/training institute. 6. Satisfaction with training of trainees and their institute of employment. | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. There are 5,936 trainees in total including 2,044 females and there is no any dropout for such short courses or at least there are replacements with new people. 2. There are 919 trainees facilitated under TF Priority Sector 1; 196 for sector 2; 3,317 for sector 3; 1,196 for sector 4; 0 trainee for sector 5; and 308 trainees for sector 6 (see sector details in Annex 1 and 7) 3. There are 5,936 trainees enrolled in total 4. Although the training courses are quite short, but trainers and beneficial institutions proved that those trainings produced positive results. |

| | | | |
|--|---|--|--|
| | | <p>5. The MTR found that the TF is appreciated by the beneficiaries.</p> <p>6. They satisfy with TF and need further support.</p> <p>1. The trainees satisfied with training results and proposed for further training. It was also found that application is partly done.</p> <p>2. The institutes of employment expressed sincere gratitude and thanks to Training Facility particularly the Lao government and BTC for financial support in building and strengthening capacities for their staffs.</p> <p>3. Some studies were carried out and further support to application initiatives and refresher training were done.</p> | |
| IR. 3. Knowledge and skills acquired from training are effectively applied. | <p>1. Post-training satisfaction with applicability and impact of training result by trainee.</p> <p>2. Post-training satisfaction with applicability and impact of training result by place of employment.</p> <p>3. Nature of post-training professional activities, promotions and/or special initiatives (e.g. research...)</p> | | |
| IR.4. Knowledge and skills acquired from training are effectively multiplied if applicable. | <p>1. Post-training satisfaction with multiplication of training results by trainee.</p> <p>2. Post-training satisfaction with multiplication of training result by place of employment.</p> <p>3. Nature of post-training multiplication activities, (e.g. dissemination through training, publication,...)</p> | <p>1. The trainees who attended in ToT courses satisfied with the training results and transfer are carried out in different technical and vocational schools. This is also convinced the TF beneficiary institutions.</p> <p>2. The institutes of employment also satisfied with multiplication of training results and requested for further support.</p> <p>3. Many multiplication initiatives under different TF priority sectors were facilitated in 2007.</p> | |
| Planned activities during the year considered | | | |
| IR.1. An efficient mechanism for facilitating training has been put into operation | <p>A1 Set up office</p> <p>A2 Operationalise HR (staff, steering committee, selection committee) and train staff</p> <p>A3 Install procedures (for announcement, selection, administration, monitoring and evaluation)</p> <p>A4 Operationalise financial administration</p> <p>A5 Install efficient co-ordination network with partner donors of scholarships</p> <p>A6 Install efficient co-ordination with the Scholarships Unit Brussels (for training staff and support)</p> <p>A7 Build database of institutes and programmes</p> | <p>Progress of the activities (with comments and remarks)</p> <p>A1: Completed and some improvement done such as two ventilating fans and two office doors installed and a small parking lot was annexed.</p> <p>A2: Done – PCU members attended in some short training, workshop and study tour such as in 2005: FIT training, M&E training in Laos, Rural development training in Korea, a symposium workshop and a study tour in Thailand, and an Education Seminar in Belgium; In 2006: a study tour to vocational schools in Thailand; In 2007: a study tour and exchange visit to Cambodia and a training on using competencies in HRM/HRD in Thailand.</p> <p>A3: Done – verbal announcements made sufficient proposals, PCU has monthly meeting while JSC meet up on proposal or invitation by PCU and PSC meet every six month, selection guideline and simple database exist.</p> <p>A4: Done by Project Administrator/Accountant with support from Project Coordinators, RR and HQ. Excel and FIT programs are used financial planning, cash calls and reporting.</p> <p>A5: The training and scholarships specialist visited TF as part of MTR mission and no regular coordination.</p> | |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>(supply) + networking</p> <p>A8 Operationalise administration of information related to candidates (including system for tracing back trainees after training)</p> | <p>A6: No co-ordination with the Scholarships Unit Brussels</p> <p>A7: Simple database and diversify the data on training supply made following recommendation of the backstopping mission.</p> <p>A8: Service contracts signed, implemented and M&E and reporting carried out.</p> |
| <p>IR.2. Candidates selected have successfully participated in training initiatives</p> <p>A1 Organise a baseline survey at the level of the TF demand entities</p> <p>A2 Make an overall needs analysis and match needs with supply</p> <p>A3 Announce training facility</p> <p>A4 Pre-select candidates (processing applications) and programmes</p> <p>A5 Select candidates, programmes and trainers</p> <p>A6 Operationalise training initiatives</p> <p>A7 Monitor, evaluate training initiatives</p> | <p>A1: Full baseline survey is not carried out except for short visits with informal interviews</p> <p>A2: Needs analysis has been done during the screening and selection process.</p> <p>A3: Done - TF is presented in several meetings with government and donors representatives.</p> <p>A4: Done - PCU is responsible for pre-selection and screening of proposals submitted by government authorities.</p> <p>A5: Done - JSC is responsible for final selection of proposals submitted by the PCU.</p> <p>A6: The training activities are implemented on the basis of service contracts signed between JSC and the providers. By end of November 2007 few training courses are ongoing and they are expected to be completed within December 2007.</p> <p>A7: Mainly pre-tests and post-tests evaluations were carried out by the training providers and the PCU conducted monitoring visits to most training courses.</p> |
| <p>IR.3. Knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training are effectively applied.</p> <p>A1 Organise a tracer study</p> <p>A2 Design post-training application activities</p> <p>A3 Organise and support application activities</p> <p>A4 Monitor, evaluate post-training application initiatives</p> | <p>A1: Partly done in March 2007 during backstopping mission.</p> <p>A2: Some training application activities organized in 2007</p> <p>A3: More refresher training courses facilitated in 2007.</p> <p>A4: Monitoring and evaluation of post-training application initiatives partly done.</p> |
| <p>IR.4. Knowledge, skills and attitudes acquired from training are effectively multiplied</p> <p>A1 Organise a tracer study (may coincide with R3, A1)</p> <p>A2 Collect information about post-training multiplication activities</p> <p>A2 Organise and support multiplication activities</p> <p>A3 Monitor, evaluate post-training multiplication initiatives</p> | <p>A1: Partly done in March 2007 during backstopping mission.</p> <p>A2: Some training application activities organized in 2007</p> <p>A3: More refresher training and ToT courses facilitated in 2007.</p> <p>A4: Monitoring and evaluation of post-training application initiatives partly done.</p> |

Annex 2: Situation of Receipt and Expenses up to 24 March 2008

| Budget Code | Description of the budget headings | Task Code | Sector Code | Total Cost Belgian Contribution | Cumulated Expenses | Expenses year Considered | Expenses year +1 |
|---|--|-----------|-------------|---------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|------------------|
| PART A : Education | | | | | | | |
| Result 1 : TF mechanism A_01 | | | | | | | |
| A_01_01 | Missions CTB-Variaen | | | 7,000.00 | 6,286.41 | 3,868.46 | 713.59 |
| A_01_02 | Scholarship/project placement | | | 5,670.00 | | | 5,670.00 |
| | Subtotal Result 1 | | | 12,670.00 | 6,286.41 | 3,868.46 | 6,383.59 |
| PART 2 : Training Operation A_02 | | | | | | | |
| A_02_01 | Training costs operationalising training | | | 568,289.31 | 568,256.30 | 9,458.64 | 33.01 |
| | Subtotal Result 2 | | | 568,289.31 | 568,256.30 | 9,458.64 | 33.01 |
| PART 3 : TF Applications A_03 | | | | | | | |
| A_03_01 | Training costs application | | | 0.01 | 2.19 | - | (2.18) |
| | Subtotal Result 3 | | | 0.01 | 2.19 | - | (2.18) |
| PART 4 : TF Multiplication A_04 | | | | | | | |
| A_04_01 | Training costs multiplication | | | 27,564.46 | 27,446.16 | 27,446.16 | 118.30 |
| | Subtotal Result 4 | | | 27,564.46 | 27,446.16 | 27,446.16 | 118.30 |
| | Subtotal Education | | | 608,523.78 | 601,991.06 | 40,773.26 | 6,532.72 |
| PART B : General Means | | | | | | | |
| Result 1 : General means | | | | | | | |
| Z_01_01 | Human resources | | | 53,400.00 | 48,165.74 | 2,497.02 | 5,234.26 |
| Z_01_02 | Monitoring and evaluation | | | 1,294.35 | 1,294.35 | - | - |
| Z_01_03 | Working costs | | | 54,600.02 | 54,398.79 | 6,489.49 | 704.41 |
| Z_01_04 | Investment | | | 17,350.00 | 16,767.74 | 280.00 | 79.08 |
| Z_01_05 | Unforeseen | | | 3,000.00 | - | - | 3,000.00 |
| | Subtotal Result 1 | | | 129,644.37 | 120,626.62 | 9,266.51 | 9,017.75 |
| | Subtotal General mean | | | 129,644.37 | 120,626.62 | 9,266.51 | 9,017.75 |
| | GRAND TOTAL | | | 738,168.15 | 722,617.68 | 50,039.77 | 15,550.47 |

ANNEX 3: Disbursement rate of the project.

| Source of financing | Cumulated budget | Real cumulated expenses | Cumulated disbursement rate | Comments and remarks |
|---------------------------------------|------------------|-------------------------|--|--|
| Direct Belgian Contribution | 738,168.15 € | 722,617.68 € | 725,498.15 € (co-management budget) | Up to 24 March 2008, 100% of co-management budget disbursed and about 99% spent. However, some more expenses e.g. staff salary and pensions, administrative cost and project closing are foreseen by end of March. |
| Contribution of the Partner Country | | | | |
| Contribution of the Counterpart Funds | | | | |
| Other source | | | | |

ANNEX 4 : Personnel of the project

| Personnel type (title, name and gender) | Duration of recruitment (start and end dates) | Comments (recruitment period, profile relevance ...) |
|--|---|---|
| 1. National personnel put at disposal by the Partner Country a) Mr. Sanexay SADETTAN , Part-time Project Coordinator, seconded by Dept. of Intl. Cooperation (DIC), Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA) b) Mr. Vanpheng SENGMANOTHONG , Part-time Project Coordinator from DIC/CPI c) Mr. Vannalek Leuang , Part-time Academic Technician seconded by Dept. of Higher Technical and Vocational Education (DHTVE), Ministry of Education (MoE) | Nov 1 st 2004 – 30 th July 2007 July 2007 to 31 st Dec. 2007 Jan. 1 st 2005 – 13 th May 2007 | French language Teacher, MBA in Human Resource Management (HRM) Teacher, French and English languages, international cooperation by profession... Machinery Engineering |
| 2. Support personnel, locally recruited a) Ms. Chanthanom Pasertkhamla , Full-time Office Cleaner/Assistant | Jan. 17 th 2005 – 31 st Dec. 2007 | Cleaning skills, administrative assistant |
| 3. Training personnel, locally recruited (by BIC) a) Mr. Intha Phanouvong , Full-time Project Coordinator b) Ms. Thavivanh Phommavanh , Full-time Admin/ Accountant c) Mr. Kongmy Keopathoum , Full-time General Assistant | Nov. 1 st 2004 – 31 st Dec. 2007 Jul. 15 th 2006 – 31 st Dec. 2007 Mar. 1 st 2007 – 31 st Dec. 2007 | English language skills, project management and Rural Development by experience, Geographic Information System and Global Positioning System (GIS/GPS) ... Marketing Management; Administration, Finance and accounting, English language ... Banking, basic English skills |
| 4 International personnel (outside BIC) | | |
| 5. Expert in International Cooperation (BIC) a) Dr. Alain Devaux , BIC Resident Representative | Aug. 25 th 2005 - 30 th July 2007 | Medical doctor, ... |

ANNEX 5: Subcontracting activities and invitations to tender
(one form for each subcontracting contract)

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Tendering mode | : | Selection of quotation/proposal |
| Date of the invitation to tender | : | 2 nd November 2007 |
| Start date of the subcontracting contract | : | 16 th November 2007 |
| Name of the subcontractor (or of the company) | : | ACCMIN Consulting and Service Co; Ltd |
| Object of the contract | : | Provision of the service for financial audit of the Training Facility |
| Cost of the contract | : | US\$ 5,670 |
| Duration of the contract | : | 19 th November to 5 th December 2007 |

Results :

Successfully completed!

Comments :

The process of selection of an audit firm was carried out by the PCU, with support from JSC and the BTC Representative Office in Phnom Penh, Cambodia. IF Laos adapted the documents used for a recent audit of IF in Cambodia e.g. ToR, selection table and criteria and the service contract.

The PCU sent the invitation letter and other related documents to four or five audit firms requesting for submission of their audit proposals. Unfortunately, some audit firms confirmed the receipt of the document and only one of them submitted the technical and financial proposal although deadline was extended for two more days and follow up emails and telephone calls made. Therefore, ACCMIN Consulting and Services Co; Ltd, was jointly selected and awarded by JSC members on November 14th 2007 on the basis of the set criteria and the service contract was signed by the two parties on November 16th 2007. The actual audit took course on November 19th 2007 following the international audit standard. The final audit report was submitted to the PCU in the later time after the payment was made.

ANNEX 6 : List of the (major) equipments acquired during the project

| Equipment type | Cost | | Delivery date | | Remarks/User |
|---|---------|----------|---------------|----------|---------------------------------|
| | Budget | Real | Planned | Real | |
| VEHICLE: | | | | | |
| Motorbike No 810 (Honda Wave 125R) | 2,000 € | 1,030 \$ | Jan/05 | 17/5/05 | Tax exemption PCU |
| Motorbike No 937 (Honda Wave 125i) | | 1,465 \$ | | 15/5/06 | Tax exemption PCU |
| OFFICE AND IT EQUIPMENT (budget: 12,850 €) | | | | | |
| Laptop Compaq Presario X1000 | 4,500 € | 1,550 \$ | | 19/11/04 | Mr Intha |
| PC Computer HP Compaq DC7100 | | 1,131 \$ | | 23/12/04 | Mr Kongmy |
| Laptop Acer Travel Mate 4000WNCLI | | 1,550 \$ | | 27/12/04 | Mr. Sanexay (MoFA) |
| Laptop Acer Travel Mate 4100 | | 1,550 \$ | | 27/12/04 | Mr. Vannalek |
| Laptop Toshiba Satellite A50-S430G | | 1,650 \$ | | 27/12/04 | Mr Pheng (MoFA) |
| LCD Projector HP Digital VP 6110 | | 1,550 \$ | | 27/12/04 | PCU |
| HP Printer 1180c | 2,500 € | 370 \$ | | 19/11/04 | PCU |
| Printer HP LaserJet 1320 | | 235 \$ | | 27/12/04 | PCU |
| Printer HP LaserJet 1320 | | 235 \$ | | 27/12/04 | Mr. Vanpheng (DIC/MPI) |
| Scanner HP Scanjet 2400 | | 110 \$ | | 23/12/04 | PCU |
| Sony Camera – Cyber Shot DSC P150 (7.2 Mplz) | | 550 \$ | | 27/12/04 | Mr. Sanexay (MoFA) |
| Sony Camera – Cyber Shot DSC P200 (7.2 Mplz) | | 367 \$ | | 18/6/06 | Mr Pheng (MoFA) |
| Sony Camera – Cyber Shot DSC- T100 (8.1 Mplz) | | 611 \$ | | 20/6/07 | PCU Plus 512 MB memory stick |
| Panasonic Fax KXFL 512 | 300 € | 500 \$ | | 27/12/04 | PCU |
| Nokia mobile phone 6260 | | 429 \$ | | 12/12/04 | Mr. Intha (poor condition) |
| Nokia mobile phone 6260 | | 429 \$ | | 12/12/04 | Mr Sanexay (MoFA) Lost! |
| Ricoh 4621 Copy Machine | 5,000 € | 1,650 \$ | | 20/12/04 | PCU |
| All Furniture | 2,500 € | 2,485 \$ | | | PCU |

NOTE: Listed above only major equipment, please see the attached inventories for details!

Annex 7. Trainings

| Training type | Country, Institution, Duration | Name or number of trained people | Dates of the trainings | Subject, content and level |
|---------------|---|--|---|---|
| Traineeship | Mainly in Laos, few in Vietnam and Thailand | 5,936 people (2,044 female) were trained | From 3 days to 6 months (see Annex 1 for additional details) | 1) Public Administration; 2) Human Rights; 3) Technical and Vocational; 4) Rural Development; Public Health |
| Scholarship | Laos only | 46 students incl. 27 females (44 in 2006 and 2 in 2007); 12 students study Bachelor Degree and 34 study on technical and higher diploma level. | Sept/2006 – June/2011 (3 years for Technical and higher Diploma and 5 years for Bachelor Degree) | <u>Bachelor Degree:</u> 1) Laws; 2) Tourism; 3) Animal Husbandry; 4) Economic and Administration; 5) Agriculture; 6) Forestry; 7) French; 8) English <u>Diploma Level:</u> 1) Nurse; 2) Geography; 3) Electric; 4) Hotel Management; 5) Accounting and Finance; 6) Secretary; 7) Mechanic; 8) English; 9) Irrigation; 10) Electronic |
| Workshop | | | | |
| Other | | | | |

